DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 309 524 EA 021 102

AUTHOR Leddick, Linda
TITLE Factors Related to Promotion and Retention Decisions.
INSTITUTION Detroit Public Schools, Mich. Dept. of Research and Evaluation.
PUB DATE Jul 88
NOTE 153p.
PUB TYPE Reports - Research/Technical (143) -- Reports - General (140)

EDRS PRICE MF01/PC07 Plus Postage.
DESCRIPTORS *Academic Failure; Academic Persistence; *Attendance; Elementary Education; *Enrollment Rate; *Grade Repetition; Language Arts; Low Achievement; Mathematics; *School Holding Power; Standardized Tests; *Student Promotion; Underachievement
IDENTIFIERS *Detroit Public Schools MI

ABSTRACT

This study examines promotion and retention standards at the elementary school level in Detroit Public Schools. Forty-eight teachers from five schools participated. Data collected for each of 420 randomly selected students included: (1) mastery and nonmastery ratings on each of the essential skills in language arts, affective education, and mathematics; (2) attendance, length of enrollment, and citizenship information; and (3) standardized achievement test scores. Data indicate that males are more likely to be retained than females. Students proposed for retention exhibited poorer attendance, citizenship, and attainment of essential skills than did students proposed for promotion. Hispanic students appear to be more highly represented in the retained group than are students who carry other ethnic codes. Citizenship ratings are poorer for students proposed for retention than for those proposed for promotion. The major recommendation of the study is strategy development at each school to improve students' attendance, citizenship, and other factors related to attending to the business of school. Appendices include teachers' ratings of skills, teachers' comments, and a sample of forms. (SI)

****
* Reproductions supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made *
* from the original document. *
****

ED309524

Factors Related to Promotion and Retention Decisions

U.S. DEPARTMENT OF EDUCATION
Office of Educational Research and Improvement
EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)

X This document has been reproduced as received from the person or organization originating it.

☐ Minor changes have been made to improve reproduction quality.

• Points of view or opinions stated in this document do not necessarily represent official OERI position or policy.

"PERMISSION TO REPRODUCE THIS MATERIAL HAS BEEN GRANTED BY

Linda Leddick

TO THE EDUCATIONAL RESOURCES INFORMATION CENTER (ERIC)."

Linda Leddick, Ph.D., Principal Investigator

Research and Evaluation Department
Office of Planning, Research and Evaluation
Detroit Public Schools

July 1988

EA 021 102

BEST COPY AVAILABLE

FACTORS RELATED TO PROMOTION AND RETENTION DECISIONS

Table of Contents

	Page
Executive Summary	i
Full Report	
Acknowledgments	1
Program Description	2
Methodology	3
Design	3
Committee	3
Forms	3
Sample	5
Presentation of the Data	10
Descriptive	10
Absences	14
Citizenship	16
Attainment of Skills	16
Matched Case Analysis	24
Percents of Students Mastering	29
Teachers' Rating of Skills	30
Citywide Test Scores	38
a. MEAP	38
b. CAT	38
c. ABCS	41
Teachers' Questionnaires	49
Summary and Conclusions	51
Recommendations	56
Appendices	59
Appendix A - Teachers' Ratings of Skills	60
Appendix B - Teachers' Comments	88
Appendix C - A Sample of Forms	95

FACTORS RELATED TO PROMOTION AND RETENTION DECISIONS

EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

PURPOSE AND FEATURES

As part of a continuing effort to improve Detroit Public Schools, the district has been engaged in an examination of promotion and retention standards at the elementary school level. This effort has spanned several years and included numerous individuals working on a variety of committees.

The effort, to date, has resulted in the development of a proposed support system and identification of Essential Learning Skills in language arts, mathematics and affective education for Kindergarten through Grade 5. It is with the latter item, the Essential Learning Skills, that this study is concerned.

The purposes of this study were to:

1. Ascertain the potential usefulness of the Essential Learning Skills as indicators for promotion and retention.

2. Assess teacher perceptions of the grade appropriateness of the skills after the teachers had used them in an actual student rating situation.

3. Gather relational information about multiple variables such as attendance, skill mastery, length of school enrollment, the essential skills and the promotion and retention status of students.

This Executive Summary highlights significant findings, conclusions and recommendations presented in the full report. The reader desiring more complete information is directed to the full report available from the Research and Evaluation Department.

METHODOLOGY

The study was designed by a group of individuals representing various constituencies within the system and members of the Research and Evaluation Department. The committee generated the types of information to be gathered, developed and reviewed forms, and in some cases, participated in presentations to the schools.

Staff members from five schools participated in the study. Forty-eight homeroom and platoon teachers either volunteered or were nominated by principals for participation. Time during the regular school day was used for the conduct of the study.

A random sample of ten students per class was selected by the Research and Evaluation Department. (Of the resulting sample of 420 students, 46 (11%) were being considered for retention in their current grades.)

Data collected for each student included mastery and non-mastery ratings on each of the Essential Skills in language arts, affective education and mathematics; attendance, length of enrollment and citizenship information; and standardized achievement test scores. In addition to providing individual student data, teachers rated the appropriateness of the Essential Skills for each grade (a sample of counselors rated the affective skills also), identified curricular needs for skill instruction, and completed a questionnaire related to the rating process and current promotion and retention policies in their schools. Data were collected in June, 1988.

Findings and Recommendations

Summary and Conclusions

Broadly stated conclusions and findings of the study are presented in narrative form; a listing of specifics follows the narrative.

Data indicate that males are more likely to be retained than females. Students proposed for retention are also frequently proposed for special education and special projects (Chapter 1 and Article 3) services; about one half of the retained students received the latter services.

Students proposed for retention exhibited poorer attendance, citizenship, and attainment of Essential Skills than did students proposed for promotion. Within the subject areas of reading and mathematics, there were discernible "cut levels" above which students were only promoted. However, depending upon the grade and subject area, the cut level could range from mastery of just a few objectives to mastery of nearly all of them. When the percents of students mastering individual skills within each subject area were examined, it was found that the number of skills for which 75% or more of the students received mastery ratings was quite low. In fact, in some cases zero skills fit the criteria. A review of students' achievements on citywide tests indicated a lack of correlation between test scores and retention recommendations.

Teachers felt that the majority of Essential Skills were appropriate but that additional instructional materials would be helpful. There was some indication that staff are not fully aware of their schools' promotion/retention policies and the relationship of the Strands and Objectives to their schools' curriculum and the Essential Skills. They also indicated currently using some type of subject matter mastery assessment to make promotion decisions. "Instructional Adjustments" were less frequently mentioned than "Notification of Parents" as actions taken before student retention is a fait accompli.

A more specific list of the findings is presented below:

1. Males are nearly twice as likely to be retained as are females.

2. Of students proposed for retention, all of whom attend schools which received Article 3 services, 54% received such services. Of the 46% who did not receive Article 3 services, not one was listed on their school's "Article 3 Ranked Student List."

3. Three students (6.5%) of those proposed for retention carry a Hispanic ethnic code. One of these students is serviced by a bilingual program. Hispanic students appear to be more highly represented in the retained group than are students who carry other ethnic codes. Caution should be used in interpreting these data because of the small number of Hispanic students in the sample.

4. Over ten percent (10.9%) of the students proposed for retention had been suspended one time. This is in contrast to 3.3% of the students proposed for promotion who had been suspended 1, 2, or 3 times.

5. Over twenty-three percent (23.9%) of the students proposed for retention had also been recommended for special education services.

6. Students proposed for promotion and retention had similar patterns of length of enrollment in the school and classroom.

7. There is a significant difference in the absentee rates between the two categories of students with over 70% of the retained students being absent 11 or more days and 43% of the promoted students being similarly absent.

8. Citizenship ratings are poorer for students proposed for retention than for those proposed for promotion. While 44% of the retained students received ratings of "Poor," only 14% of the promoted students were so rated. Conversely while 15% of the retained students were rated as "excellent," 39% of the promoted students were so rated.

9. In general, there was a significant difference in the number of Essential Skills rated as attained between the groups proposed for retention and promotion. These differences were greater for language arts and mathematics than for affective skills.

10. Students who had been <u>previously</u> retained also were rated as attaining lower numbers of objectives. This is true at all grades except for Grade 1.

11. For the entire sample, in language arts and mathematics there appears to be a "cut score" in the number of skills rated as mastered such that below the cut score students may be retained or promoted; above the cut score, students are only promoted. The cut scores vary widely by grade, ranging from mastery of 20% to 90% of the Essential Skills.

12. Within individual classrooms, 14 pairs of students were identified such that one student was designated for promotion and another for retention although the 2 students had similar ratings for skill mastery. When these pairs were examined as a sub-study entitled the "Matched Case Analysis," it was found that the retained member of the set was more likely to:

    a. Have been enrolled in the classroom for a longer period of time;

    b. Also have been recommended for Special Education;

    c. Have been previously retained;

d. Have been absent about the same number of times but tardy more frequently

e. Have been given a worse citizenship rating.

While the results related to absences and enrollment appear to contradict earlier findings related to the entire sample, these data support the notion that factors indicating that students are attending to the business of school are related to retention decisions.

13. When student attainments of individual skills were examined for the entire sample, it was found that:

    a. The number of skills for which 75% or more of the students attained mastery decreased as the grade increased;

    b. The number of skills for which 75% or more of the students received mastery ratings was quite low, in some cases only 2, 1 or 0 skills had over 75% of the students mastering; and

    c. When teachers indicated that students did not master objectives, the most frequently given reason was that the skill had been, "taught but not mastered."

14. Teachers rated the majority of skills as being at an appropriate difficulty level for the grade level.

15. Teachers indicated a need for "instructional materials" and "work sheets" related to the skills. Also needed, but to a lesser degree, were "tests" and "instructional strategies."

16. A review of the citywide achievement test scores attained by students proposed for retention indicates that:

    a. Grade 4 MEAP - 4 of 8 students proposed for retention were in Category 4 for the reading test, 6 of 8 for the math test. Four of the eight students were in Category 4 on both the reading and math tests.

    b. Grade 3 CAT - The group grade mean equivalent for reading was 2 months lower than the city, 3 months lower than the national norm. For mathematics, the group was 5 months below the city, 2 months below the nation.

    c. Grade 5 CAT - The group was 18 months below the city and 21 months below the nation in reading. In mathematics, the group was 15 months below the city, 14 months below the nation.

    d. ABCS - In general, retained students performed at substantially lower levels than did students citywide. There appears to be a significant relationship between retained students scores on the ABCS tests and the rating of Essential Skills mastered only for Grade 2 language arts skills.

17. Teachers spent 6 to 8 minutes completing the Essential Skill Check List for each student.

18. When asked if their school's curriculum was "broader than" the Essential Skills, 44% of the teachers indicated "Yes." Compared to the "Strands and Objectives," 32% of the teachers felt that the schools curriculum was broader. This was a subjective assessment.

19. Teachers in two buildings were unanimous in saying that their schools already had a "Retention/Promotion Policy." In the other buildings responses were split between "Yes," "No," and "In Process."

20. The majority of teachers felt that the affective education skills on the Essential Skills Check List were "Somewhat" related to citizenship marks.

21. Teachers felt that the Essential Skills Check List would be most helpful in counseling parents and students. They also felt that it would be somewhat helpful in making and supporting promotion and retention decisions.

22. Teachers felt that the Essential Skills Check List would be most appropriate for use with students considered for retention and/or all students.

23. Teachers indicated that they currently make promotion/retention decisions based on some assessment of subject matter mastery.

24. When asked to identify actions taken before retaining a student, teachers most often mentioned "notification of parents." Instructional adjustments were less frequently mentioned.

Recommendations

1. Develop strategies at each school to improve students' attendance, citizenship, and other factors related to attending to the business of school. Recommended strategies include:

   a. System-wide form letters to be sent home at the beginning of the school year informing parents of the relationship between retention and attendance, tardiness and citizenship.

   b. Letters to be sent after students have been absent or tardy for five times and at all subsequent intervals of 5.

   c. Mandated home/school contact by letter or telephone when a student's citizenship is deemed less than satisfactory.

   d. Parental conferences to accompany a, b, and c above.

2. Confer with appropriate governmental authorities to adjust Article 3 service guidelines to include students for whom test scores are not available and/or are deemed to be in need of service at a time in the school year after the original selection process has been completed.

3. Revise the Essential Skills taking into consideration teachers' perceptions and students' performance as presented in this report.

4. Develop an instructional support system to provide assistance to students who demonstrate that they may be in danger of not mastering the Essential Learning Skills.

5. Key the Essential Skills to the Detroit Strands and Objectives and provide inservice training to staff on same.

6. Provide alternative teaching strategies for retained students to insure their success.

7. Provide assistance to teachers who have students whom they feel are qualified for but who do not meet Special Education selection criteria. Such assistance may take the form of additional staff service, materials, or innovative programs to name a few possibilities.

8. Do not establish a cut-off level for skill attainment until the program model has been in operation for at least two years. This will insure that teachers have knowledge of the Essential Learning Skills and sufficient techniques to provide appropriate instruction and make valid assessments of mastery. This will also allow for the collection of sufficient baseline data to make an informed decision regarding cut-off levels.

9. Implement a set of promotion and retention criteria only if accompanied by a set of criteria for remedial actions to be taken before retention occurs.

Issues to be Addressed

Various issues need to be addressed to insure the establishment of an equitable and comprehensive promotion retention policy. Some of these issues are presented below.

1. Issues related to the making of promotion and retention decisions

   a. The promotion of students demonstrating subject matter knowledge similar to that of retained students and vice versa

   b. Informing all staff as to the presence or absence of school-wide promotion/retention policies

   c. Addressing the fact that students who were previously retained perform at lower levels than non-retained students at all grades except Grade 1

   d. Setting appropriate cut levels for Essential Skill mastery, if same is to be used for promotion/retention decisions

   e. Identifying other promotion/retention decision factors to be used with outliers, i.e., those students who score below the cut level but may be designated either for promotion or retention

2. Measurement related issues

   a. Addressing citywide test score issues related to students performing better on same than teacher ratings of Essential Skill attainments would indicate

   b. Identifying the specific, concrete data a teacher would need in order to check an Essential Skill as attained

   c. The assessment of students recommended for Special Education services

3. Issues related to instruction and failure prevention

   a. Addressing the logic of the concept that a skill can be "taught" but not mastered

   b. Identifying concrete sets of instruction based activities to be conducted when students are in a position of possible retention

c. The provision of Article 3 services to students who are potential retentions

d. Addressing the appropriateness of the Essential Skills when they are deemed by teachers to be at an appropriate difficulty level and yet low percents of students appear to be attaining them; addressing the instructional implications of same

e. Assessing what is currently being used for instruction for Essential Skills which are deemed to be:

1. At the appropriate difficulty level and

2. Taught but not mastered

but

3. In need of instructional materials

f. Providing needed instructional materials to staff

4. Issues related to cooperative efforts of home and school

a. Improving attendance

b. Decreasing tardiness

c. Improving citizenship as measured by teacher ratings and suspensions from school.

Recommendations for Future Studies

It is recommended that the 46 students identified as being "proposed for retention" in this study be followed in order to assess:

1. If they actually are retained based on the 1988-89 grade level, and

2. Their future academic and social performance on variables similar to those examined in this study.

It is also recommended that the 28 students in the Matched Case Study be followed to assess the differences between students proposed for retention and those proposed for promotion.

FACTORS RELATED TO PROMOTION AND RETENTION DECISIONS

FULL REPORT

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

Special thanks are extended to the principals and teachers who participated in this study. Without them, this research could never have been conducted.

Bow School

E. Harden Graves, Principal
Joyce Beasley
Bonnie Bisio
Vivian Bowman
Joyce Braun
Angela Jones
Nettie Mitchell
Olivia Saddler
Gwendolyn Spears
Trecia Stewart
Marsha Storey

Harms School

James Taylor, Principal
Marcella Bridges
Brett Clark
Frances Edwards
Connie Kilgo
Francine Korenoski
Eunice Mabarez
Mary Maesco
Frances Nyzyk
Maxine Taylor
Linda Van Woerkum
Ann Zuazo

Herman School

Marcella Verdun, Principal
Norma Arim
Loretta Bruner
Paula Kalt
Regina Love
Helen O'Neal
Sylvia Sanders
Terry Susick
Miranda Washington

Sanders School

Thomas Washington, Principal
Peggy Carr
C. Everett
D. Hansknechts
M. Humes
E. Jones
R. Neal

Van Zile School

Elsie Dade, Principal
Diane Armstrong
Linda Brown
Karen Cherny
Linda Dean
Herbert Heritier
Sandra Hughes
Bonnie Johnson
Shirley Johnson
Mary Ann Moyer
Joya Powell
Patricia Sikora
Carol White
Renee Wilson

PROGRAM DESCRIPTION

As part of a continuing effort to improve Detroit Public Schools, the district has been engaged in an examination of promotion and retention standards at the elementary school level. This effort has spanned several years and included numerous individuals working on a variety of committees.

The effort, to date, has resulted in the development of a proposed support system and identification of Essential Learning Skills in language arts, mathematics and affective education for Kindergarten through Grade 5. It is with the latter item, the Essential Learning Skills, that this study is concerned.

The number of Essential Learning Skills as currently drafted are shown on Table 1.

Table 1

Number of Skills

Skill Area	Grade					
	Kdg	1	2	3	4	5
Language Arts	12	13	12	13	12	10
Affective	4	5	5	5	5	5
Mathematics	9	10	10	11	11	11

The purposes of this study were to :

1. Ascertain the potential usefulness of the Essential Learning Skills as indicators for promotion and retention.

2. Assess teacher perceptions of the grade appropriateness of the skills <u>after</u> the teachers had used them in an actual student rating situation.

3. Gather relational information about multiple variables such as attendance, skill mastery, length of school enrollment, the essential skills and the promotion and retention status of students.

METHODOLOGY

Design

The study was designed by a group of individuals representing various constituencies within the structure of the school district and members of the Research and Evaluation Department. The committee identified the types of information to be gathered, developed and reviewed data collection forms, and in some cases, participated in presentations to the schools. The study committee was composed of the following individuals:

Study Committee

Helen Adams	- Educational Services
John Andary	- Research and Evaluation
Jessie Baker	- Curriculum Development Services
Elizabeth Duhn	- Coolidge School/Detroit Federation of Teachers
Joe Green	- Organization of School Administrators and Supervisors
Frances Hill	- Detroit Federation of Teachers
Leslie Holland	- Area F/Special Education
Sharon Johnson-Lewis	- Research and Evaluation
Linda Kolnowski	- Mathematics Education
Linda Leddick	- Research and Evaluation
Olivette Pearson	- Language Education
Yvonne Roberts	- Area E/Curriculum
Keith Stockwell	- Research and Evaluation

Data Collection Forms

In order to answer research questions developed by the committee, three data gathering instruments were designed and used in the study: (Actual forms are presented in the appendix.)

1. Student Profile - Student Profiles for Grades K-5 had uniform cover sheets for biographical information including:

    a. Name, Birthdate, ID Number
    b. Attendance
    c. Special Education Status
    d. Retention History
    e. Citizenship Ratings

Each profile also contained listings of language arts, affective and mathematics essential skills appropriate for the grade level of the student. For each skill on the form, teachers were to designate student mastery or non mastery. Non-mastery was to be indicated as one of the following:

a. Not yet taught
b. Taught but not mastered
c. Needs prerequisite skills
d. Late enrollment

2. Skills Rating Forms - The Skills Rating Form contained the same skills as listed on the Student Profile. Teachers completed forms appropriate to their grade level and subject matter of instruction. For each skill, teachers were asked to indicate:

   a. For this grade, the objective is-- (Check one).

      1. Too easy
      2. Appropriate
      3. Too hard
      4. Unclear (needs an example)

      and

   b. Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)

      1. Instructional materials
      2. Instructional strategies
      3. Work sheets
      4. Tests

In addition to teacher responses to the questions about the skills, a citywide group of counselors was asked to complete Skills Rating Forms for the Affective Skills.

3. Teacher Questionnaire - This questionnaire asked for teachers' assessment of:

   a. Time needed to complete forms,

   b. The schools curriculum compared to the Essential Learning Skills and the Strands and Objectives (Detroit's curriculum),

c. School policies related to promotion/ retention and affective education,

d. Students for whom completion of the Essential Learning Skills Check List would be of assistance, and

e. What is currently used to make promotion/ retention decisions and actions taken before retention is mandated.

Materials were prepackaged for teachers with student labels attached containing each student's name, ID number, birthdate, grade and school code.

Sample

1. Buildings and Teachers

The study sample was to include one school from each of the system's six geographic areas containing elementary schools. Schools were nominated for participation by Area Superintendents. In cases where more than one school was nominated, principals were interviewed about their willingness to participate. The final sample represents only five areas as one area's school was unable to participate.

Teacher involvement was a function of principals, some of whom ask for volunteers, while others invited or designated specific teachers. Principals arranged for the coverage of participating teachers' classes, thereby placing the activity within the regular school day rather than creating an additional after school activity which would have been subject to teachers' union guidelines.

Staff members involved in the study participated in an orientation meeting in which the purpose and methodology of the study were presented. Forms to be used were also reviewed. Following the orientation meeting, staff members were provided several hours to complete the necessary documents.

The numbers of teachers participating by school and grade are shown in Table 2.

Table 2

Teacher Participation

School	Grade						
	Kdg	1	2	3	4	5	Total
Harms	1	2	2	3	1	2	11
Herman	1	1	1	1	2*	2*	8
Bow	1	1	1	1	3*	3*	10
Sanders	1	1	1	1	1	1	6
Van Zile	2	2	4	1	2*	2*	13
Total	6	7	9	7	9**	10**	48

*1 teacher was a platoon mathematics teacher
**3 teachers are platoon mathematics teachers.

The building and teacher selection procedure described above is a possible source of bias in this study as it was not a random selection. It did, however, result in a selection of schools embodying a variety of characteristics. As shown on Table 3, school size ranged from 428 to 743 students. Two of the schools receive Chapter 1 monies, all of them Article 3 funds.

When the achievements of the schools are viewed by the measure of the California Achievement Tests, Form E (CAT), it is seen that for Grade 3 reading, 2 of the schools are below the city mean, 3 above. For Grade 3 mathematics, 1 school is below, 2 equal to, and 2 above the city mean. (Table 3)

For Grade 5 reading, 2 schools are below, 1 equal to and 2 above the city mean. For Grade 5 mathematics, 3 schools are below and 2 above the city mean. (Table 3)

Grade 4 percents of students attaining objectives on the Michigan Educational Assessment Program (MEAP) test of reading were lower than the city at 2 schools, higher at 3. Mathematics percents were lower at 3 schools, higher at 2. (Table 3)

Pooled means indicate that, overall, the five schools' test performance is higher than citywide performance. (Table 3)

The size of the total student sample is sufficient to generalize to the entire Grade K-5 student population in Detroit at a 95 confidence level and with a 5% sampling error. It is also sufficient to generalize to all grades except kindergarten at the 90% confidence level with a 10% sampling error. Kindergarten is seven students short for this purpose. Because, this study focuses so heavily on teacher perceptions, and since approximately 2400 teachers would be required to teach Detroit's approximately 83,000 students in kindergarten and Grades 1-5, a random sample of 66 teachers (rather than the 42 in the study) would have provided a minimally acceptable confidence level of 90% with a 10% sampling error.

Table 3

Selected Characteristics of Sample Schools

School	Area Code/ Geographic Location	Student Population				Ch1	Ar3	CAT (Grade Mean Equivalents) Fall 1987				MEAP (% Category 4) Fall 1987	
		School Size Total*	Sample Size n	Percents School	Percents Study			Grade 3 R	Grade 3 M	Grade 5 R	Grade 5 M	Grade 4 R	Grade 4 M
Harms	A South West	428	110	26	26	NO	YES	2.9	3.1	4.5	4.9	75.0	78.0
Herman	B West	569	60	11	14	YES	YES	4.5	4.2	4.9	5.7	92.4	98.7
Bow	C North West	771	80	10	19	NO	YES	2.9	3.5	4.8	4.9	69.3	80.4
Sanders	D Central	441	60	14	14	YES	YES	3.4	3.5	5.8	5.0	87.5	77.5
Van Zile	E North East	743	110	15	26	NO	YES	4.2	4.0	5.2	6.3	61.1	94.7
Total**		2952	420	14	100			3.6	3.7	5.0	5.3	75%	85%
City	Grade K-5	82855						3.1	3.5	4.9	5.3	71%	85.3%

Sums which do not equal 100% are due to rounding

*Includes counts of special education students.

**Totals for test scores are pooled means.

2. Students

Students included in the sample were randomly selected from lists of students generated by classroom groups in numeric order by ID number. Selection was done by the Research and Evaluation Department. A random set of students was also prepared for use in cases where a selected student no longer attended the school.

Randomly selected students' gender and ethnicity characteristics are present in Tables 4-5.

Table 4

Description of the Sample
Variables: Sample Size and Gender by Grade

Grade	Total		Gender			
			Male		Female	
	n	%	n	%	n	%
Kdg	60	14%	32	53%	28	47%
1	70	17	35	50	35	50
2	90	17	39	43	51	57
3	70	17	33	47	37	53
4	60	14	21	35	39	65
5	70	17	35	50	35	50
Total	420	100%	195	46%	225	54%

Table 5

Description of Sample
Variable: Ethnicity

Ethnic Group	District	Sample
1 American Indian or Alaskan Native	.27%	1.2
2 Asia or Pacific Islander	.62	.2
3 Black	88	78.8
4 Hispanic	2	3.6
5 White	9	16.0
Missing Data	1	.2

Presentation of the Data

Descriptive

The following section of this report presents data collected as a part of this study.

Table 6 presents the number of students who are currently being considered for retention per grade as well as the number of students in the sample who were previously retained and the grade at which the retention occurred. As can be seen from Table 6, the largest number of students were previously retained at Grade 3, followed in descending order by Grades 2 and 1. The smallest number of students previously retained and proposed for retention is at Grade 5.

Table 6

Number Currently Considered for Retention
and Number Previously Retained

Grade	Retention								
	Number Currently Considered	Previous							
		Number	Grade at Which Retained						
			Kdg	1	2	3	4	5	NA
Kdg	7	0							
1	13	7	1	5					1
2	9	8	0	1	6				1
3	6	19a	0	5	4	7			4
4	8	21b	1	0	9	10	3		2
5	3	17c	0	4	2	9	0	1	3
Total	46	72	2	15	21	26	3	1	

a. 1 student had been retained twice
b. 4 students had been retained twice
c. 2 students had been retained twice
NA - Not Available

Data for the sample were disaggregated to assess the extent to which particular variables were manifest in the group proposed for retention in contrast to the group proposed for promotion. Data are presented in Table 7.

Table 7

Numbers and Percents of
Students Proposed for Retention and Promotion
By Selected Variables

Variable	Proposed for Retention n	Retention %	Proposed for Promotion n	Promotion %
Gender: Male	30	65	165	44
Female	16	35	209	56
Chapter 1 Services (funded at 2 schools only)				
0 None	38	82.6	323	86.4
1 Reading	0	0	1	.3
2 Math	0	0	10	2.7
3 Reading and Math	1	2.2	14	3.7
4 Summer	2	4.3	13	3.5
5 Reading and Summer	0	0	0	0
6 Reading and Math	3	6.5	4	1.1
7 Reading, Math and Summer	2	4.3	9	2.4
Article 3 Services				
0 None	21	45.7	294	78.6
1 Reading	8	17.4	36	9.6
2 Math	1	2.2	10	2.7
3 Reading and Math	16	34.8	34	9.1
Bilingual Service	1	2.2	4	1.1
Suspensions: 1 time	5	10.9	10	2.7
2 times	0		1	.3
3 times	0		1	.3
Recommended for Special Education	11	23.9	9	2.4

Sums which do not equal 100 are due to rounding.

Data presented on Table 7 indicate that of the students proposed for retention --

- There are nearly twice as many males as females.
- Eight students (17%) were involved in Chapter 1 programs. This is not surprising as only 2 of the 5 schools were Chapter 1 funded. The eight students represent 73% of those recommended for retention at the two Chapter 1 schools. They represent 2% of the total Chapter 1 target population at the two schools.
- Over fifty percent (54%) were involved in Article 3 programs. (All five schools were Article 3 funded. Further investigation revealed that of the 46% of the students not receiving Article 3 services, none were listed on their school's "Article 3 Ranked School List.")
- Just over two percent (2.2%) are serviced in bilingual programs. (This represents 1 student; three students proposed for retention carry a Hispanic ethnic code.)
- Over ten percent (10.9%) had been suspended one time.
- Over twenty-three percent (23.9%) had been recommended for special education classes.

The ethnicity of students proposed for retention is shown in Table 8.

Table 8

Ethnicity of Students Proposed for Retention

Ethnicity	Total Sample		Proposed for Retention		
			n	Percent of Retentions	Percent of Ethnic Group in Sample
	n	%		%	%
1 American Indian or Alaskan Native	5	1.2	0	0	0
2 Asian or Pacific Islander	1	.2	0	0	0
3 Black	331	78.8	35	76.1	10.6
4 Hispanic	15	3.6	3	6.5	20.0
5 White	67	16.0	8	17.4	12.0
Total					

The small numbers presented for three of the five groups shown on Table 8 make interpretation difficult. There is some indication that close review of the promotion/retention status of Hispanic students is warranted.

Length of time enrolled in both the school and the classroom were examined. Teachers were asked to designate, for both categories, one of four percent ranges that best described the percent of the school year the student had been enrolled. Percent ranges were 0-25%, 26-50%, 51-75%, and 76-100%. Results are presented on Table 9.

Table 9

Percent of Time Enrolled
Students Proposed for Retention and
Students Proposed for Promotion

Category and Percent Range	Percents of Students			
	Retention		Promotion	
	n	%	n	%
Enrolled in School				
0 - 25	3	7	26	7
26 - 50	4	9	19	5
51 - 75	3	7	22	6
76 - 100	36	78	306	82
Enrolled in Classroom				
0 - 25	2	4	23	6
26 - 50	3	7	15	4
51 - 75	2	4	26	7
76 - 100	39	85	310	83

Data presented in Table 9 indicate a similar pattern of time enrolled for students in the group proposed for retention and the group proposed for promotion.

Absences

The percents of both students proposed for retention and students proposed for promotion are presented in Table 10 by school. Data are presented as percents of students in each of the two ranges of days absent, i.e., 0-10 days and 11 or more days absent.

As the data on Table 10 are reviewed, a trend is noted in that the percents of retained students increases in the absence categories as one reads from left to right, i.e., lowest to highest number of absences. Conversely, the percents decrease for the promoted students.

Table 10

Percents of Students in Two Categories of Absences

School	Retain			Promote		
	Number	Percents		Number	Percents	
		0-10	11 or more		0-10	11 or more
1	17	41	59	92	55	45
2	6	50	50	54	69	32
3	4	25	75	75	57	43
4	5	40	60	55	44	56
5	14	7	93	96	59	41

Sums which do not equal 100 are due to rounding.

In fact, when all schools are combined, the differences in absences for promoted and retained students are significantly different as shown in Table 11.

Table 11

Percents of Students in
High and Low Categories of Absences

Group	Days Absent			
	0-10		11 or more	
	N	%	N	%
Retain	14	30	31	70
Promote	212	57	160	43

Chi Square P<.01 df=1

This finding clearly indicates a strong relationship between attendance and promotion/retention status of students.

Citizenship

Teachers were asked to rate the citizenship of each student in the sample. Citizenship categories were poor, satisfactory and excellent. Data are presented in Table 12. Data on this table indicate that while 44% of the retained students were rated as having "poor" citizenship, only 14% of the promoted students were so rated. Conversely, 15% of the retained students were marked as excellent while 39% of the promoted students were so rated.

Table 12

Citizenship
Number and Percents in Each Category

Grade	Numbers and Percents											
	Retain						Promote					
	Total	Poor		Satis.		Exce.	Total	Poor		Satis.		Exce.	
		n	%	n	%	n %		n	%	n	%	n	%
Kdg	7	1	14	2	29	4 57	53	4	8	30	57	19	36
1	13	4	31	7	54	2 15	57	13	23	23	40	21	37
2	9	6	67	3	33	0 0	81	8	10	37	46	36	44
3	6	2	33	4	67	0 0	64	11	17	26	41	27	42
4	8	6	75	1	13	1 13	52	11	21	24	46	17	33
5	3	1	33	2	67	0 0	67	7	10	36	54	24	36
Total	46	20	44	19	41	7 15	374	54	14	176	47	144	39

Attainment of Skills

Presented on Table 13 are the mean number of skills rated as being attained by the students recommended for promotion and those recommended for retention. The significance levels for the groups are also presented and indicate significant differences between the two groups for language arts skills attainment at all grades and mathematics skills attainment at all grades except Grade 5. Affective skills attainment was significant at the .01 level for kindergarten and Grade 4, at the .05 level for Grades 1 and 2, and not significant for Grades 3 and 5.

Table 13

Mean Number of Skills Attained

Grade/Subject	Promoted Mean	Promoted SD	Retained Mean	Retained SD	t-value	df	P
Kindergarten							
Language Arts (12)	10.8	2.2	4.4	2.2	7.18	58	<.01
Affective (4)	3.8	0.7	2.6	1.8	3.47	58	<.01
Mathematics (9)	8.1	2.1	4.3	2.3	4.39	58	<.01
Grade 1							
Language Arts (13)	11.2	2.4	4.2	1.6	2.34	68	<.01
Affective (5)	4.2	1.3	3.2	1.3	2.55	68	<.05
Mathematics (10)	8.7	1.9	2.8	2.9	8.81	68	<.01
Grade 2							
Language Arts (12)	10.0	2.4	4.9	2.9	5.74	88	<.01
Affective (5)	4.0	1.5	2.7	1.7	2.44	88	<.05
Mathematics (10)	7.0	2.7	2.0	3.0	5.21	88	<.01
Grade 3							
Language Arts (13)	8.5	3.8	1.2	1.9	4.65	68	<.01
Affective (5)	3.7	1.6	2.8	2.0	1.18	68	NS
Mathematics (11)	6.3	2.9	1.8	1.7	3.68	68	<.01
Grade 4							
Language Arts (12)	7.5	4.3	1.0	1.4	4.19	58	<.01
Affective (5)	3.5	1.8	1.3	1.6	3.30	58	<.01
Mathematics (11)	5.6	3.7	1.4	1.2	3.12	58	<.01
Grade 5							
Language Arts (10)	7.6	2.7	1.0	1.0	4.24	68	<.01
Affective (5)	3.3	1.9	1.7	1.5	1.50	68	NS
Mathematics (11)	5.5	3.1	2.0	3.5	1.91	68	NS

Number in parenthesis indicate the number of skills rated.

The means of numbers of objectives rated as being mastered by the group of students proposed for retention, the group proposed for promotion, the group who had been previously retained and the group who had not been previously retained are presented on Table 14. Because different numbers of objectives were rated at different grades and for the three subject areas, percents of total numbers of objectives mastered are presented also.

An analysis of the data on Table 14 indicates that:

1. Grade 1 students who were previously retained were rated as having attained higher percents of Language Arts, Affective and Mathematics Objectives than students not previously retained. At Grades 2-5 exactly the opposite situation is revealed. It must be noted that it is not known whether the Grade 1 teachers rating the students were the same teachers who retained the Grade 1 students at the end of the previous year.

2. Students proposed for retention attained consistently lower mastery ratings than did students proposed for promotion. The differences were greater for Language Arts and Mathematics than for Affective skills.

3. In general, the percents of objectives rated as having been attained decreases as the grade level increases.

Table 14

Number of Objectives Rated, Mean Numbers of Objectives Attained and Percents of Total Objectives Rated

Group\Subject	Number of Objectives, Mean Number Attained and Percent of Total Grade																	
	K			1			2			3			4			5		
	n	mean	%	n	mean	%	n	mean	%	n	mean	%	n	mean	%	n	mean	%
Previously Retained																		
Language Arts	12	NA		13	10.6	82	12	7.5	63	13	6.1	47	12	3.6	30	10	5.6	56
Affective	4	NA		5	4.3	86	5	2.9	58	5	3.1	62	5	2.2	44	5	2.8	56
Mathematics	9	NA		10	9.1	91	10	5.0	50	11	4.5	41	11	2.8	26	11	4.9	45
Not Previously Retained																		
Language Arts	12	10.1	84	13	9.8	75	12	9.7	81	13	8.5	65	12	8.2	68	10	7.8	78
Affective	4	3.7	93	5	4.0	80	5	4.0	80	5	3.8	76	5	3.7	74	5	3.4	68
Mathematics	9	7.7	86	10	7.4	74	10	6.7	67	11	6.5	59	11	6.2	56	11	5.5	50
Proposed Retention																		
Language Arts	12	4.4	37	13	4.2	32	12	4.9	42	13	1.2	9	12	1.0	8	10	1.0	10
Affective	4	2.6	65	5	3.2	64	5	2.7	54	5	2.8	56	5	1.3	26	5	1.7	34
Mathematics	9	4.3	48	10	2.8	30	10	2.0	19	11	1.8	16	11	1.4	13	11	2.0	18
Proposed Promotion																		
Language Arts	12	10.8	90	13	11.2	86	12	10.0	83	13	8.5	65	12	7.5	63	10	7.6	76
Affective	4	3.8	95	5	4.2	84	5	4.0	80	5	3.7	74	5	3.5	70	5	3.3	66
Mathematics	9	8.1	90	10	8.7	87	10	7.0	70	11	6.3	57	11	5.6	51	11	5.5	50

NA - Not applicable as no cases at this grade.

Tables 15-17 show the number of students at each grade attaining a given number of objectives. These tables show that:

1. For the skill areas of language arts and mathematics at most grades there appears to be a definite "cut" level below which students may be retained or promoted and above which students are only promoted.

2. There are cases where retained students mastered an equal or greater number of objectives than their promoted counterparts.

3. Except for Grades 4 and 5, there appears to be no cut score for affective skills. At all other grades this finding would be consistent with recommendations issued by the promotion retention committee that promotion and retention decisions not be based on affective skill attainments.

Table 15

Maximum Numbers of Objectives Attained by Students in Groups Proposed for Retention and Promotion Language Arts Objectives

Number of Objectives	Number of Students											
	Proposed Retention Grade						Proposed Promotion Grade					
	K	1	2	3	4	5	K	1	2	3	4	5
0				3	5	1				1	4	
1			1	2		1				1	3	1
2	1	2	1		2	1	1		1	4	5	2
3	1	3	2		2				1	5	1	3
4	3	3	1					1	1	3	2	5
5	1	2		1			2	2	3		2	5
6		2	1				1	1	2	5	2	7
7		1					1	1	5	4	3	7
8			2				2	4	8	4	4	3
9	1		1				2	3	8	5	4	8
10							3	4	5	9	4	25
11							6	6	9	4	3	NO
12							35	9	38	10	15	
13							NO	26	NO	9	NO	

NO indicates no additional objectives

Table 16

Maximum Numbers of Objectives Attained by Students in Groups Proposed for Retention and Promotion Affective

Number of Objectives	Number of Students											
	Proposed Retention Grade						Proposed Promotion Grade					
	K	1	2	3	4	5	K	1	2	3	4	5
0	1		1	1	4	1	1	1	4	5	6	7
1	2	1	2	1	1			1	5	3	3	10
2		3	1		1	1	2	5	6	7	8	7
3		4	1	2	1	1	3	9	6	9	3	4
4	4	2	3		1		47	2	11	9	5	8
5	NO	3	1	2			NO	39	49	31	26	31

NO indicates no additional objectives

Table 17

Maximum Numbers of Objectives Attained by Students in Groups Proposed for Retention an Promotion Mathematics

Number of Objectives	Number of Students											
	Proposed Retention Grade						Proposed Promotion Grade					
	K	1	2	3	4	5	K	1	2	3	4	5
0	1	4	5	2	2	2	3	1	3	3	7	2
1		1		1	3				1	1	2	5
2		1	2		1				2	2	6	6
3	1	3		2	2				3	4	4	8
4	1	2		1					5	4	2	4
5	2						1	2	9	13	5	10
6	1					1	1	5	6	9	2	6
7	1		2					6	12	7	6	9
8		1					14	5	8	4	2	5
9		1					34	8	14	3	4	2
10							NO	30	18	9	8	4
11								NO	NO	5	4	6
12										NO	NO	NO

NO indicates no additional objectives

The number and percent of objectives at the "cut score" are presented in Table 18. Such cut levels for language arts and mathematics range from mastery of 20%-90% of the skills.

Table 18

Cut Scores
Maximum Number and Percent of Skills
Rated as Mastered for Retained Students

Grade	Language		Affective		Mathematics	
	n	%	n	%	n	%
K	9	75	4	100	7	78
1	7	54	5	100	9	90
2	9	75	5	100	7	70
3	5	39	5	100	4	36
4	3	25	4	80	3	27
5	2	20	3	60	6	55

Matched Case Analysis

In an attempt to ascertain differences in students designated for promotion and retention by specific teachers, an attempt was made to match promoted and retained students within individual classrooms based on attainment of the Essential Skills. In some cases matches were possible, in others, the differences in skill attainment between students proposed for retention and promotion were great enough to preclude matching. Table 19 presents the students matched for Skill Attainment and the number of skills rated as attained.

Table 19

Students Matched for Skill Attainment
and
Number of Skills Rated as Attained

Case	Class	Grade	Student Retain L	A	M	Status Promote L	A	M
1	2	2	3	0	0	2	1	1
2	3	2	9	4	0	8	4	5
3	4	3	1	3	3	2	1	5
4	5	3	5	5	4	4	0	4
5	6	4	3	0	1	2	0	2
6	6	4	3	0	1	2	0	3
7	6	4	2	2	1	2	0	0
8	7	4	0	1	0	0	2	2
9	7	4	0	3	2	1	5	1
10	8	4	0	0	0	0	1	0
11	9	4	0	4	3	0	4	4
12	10	5	1	2	6	2	2	3
13	10	5	0	0	0	3	0	3
14	11	5	2	3	0	1	0	6

Key: L - Language Arts Skills
A - Affective Skills
M - Mathematics Skills

There were no matches obtainable at the kindergarten and Grade 1 levels. At Grade 2, 2 were possible, Grade 3 had 2, Grade 4 had 7 and Grade 5 had 3. It must be remembered that these matches are from within classrooms. Therefore, it is entirely possible that there are better matches at the same grade but from a different school or different teacher. The purpose of the present analysis is to look at students who were in the same classroom and who were rated as mastering a similar number of objectives but were given different promotion and retention statuses.

When the sets are compared (Table 20) it is seen that:

1. Duration of Enrollment in the schools was the same for 6 sets, longer for the retained students in 3 sets and shorter for the retained students in 2 sets.

2. Duration of Enrollment in the classroom was the same for 8 sets, longer for the retained students in 4 sets and shorter for the retained student in 1 set.

3. Recommendations for Special Education were the same in 7 sets, "Yes" for the retained students but "No" for the promoted students in 5 sets and the opposite in 1 set.

4. Previous retention was the same in 10 sets, "Yes" for the retained students but "No for the promoted students in 3 sets and the opposite in 1 set.

5. Absences fell in the same range for 2 sets, were in higher ranges for the retained students in 6 sets and in lower ranges for retained students in 7 sets. (This contradicts findings presented earlier related to absences).

6. Tardiness fell in the same range for 7 sets, in higher ranges for retained students in 5 sets and in lower ranges for retained students in 2 sets.

7. Citizenship marks were the same for 5 sets, better for retained students in 3 sets and worse for retained students in 6 sets.

In summary, when students were rated as having attained approximately the same number of skills but one student was recommended for promotion whereas the other was recommended for retention, the retained member of the set was likely to:

1. Have been enrolled in the school about the same length of time.

2. Have been enrolled in the classroom a longer period of time.

3. Also have been recommended for Special Education services.

4. Have been previous retained.
5. Have been absent about the same number of times.
6. Have been more frequently tardy.
7. Have been given a worse citizenship rating.

Table 20

Students Matched for Skill Attainment
Differences in Other Variables

Case	Enrolled		Special	Promotion			
	School	Class	Education	Retention	Absent	Tardy	Citizenship
1 R	76	76	Y	N	5	5	P
P	76	76	Y	Y	20	20	S
2 R	76	76	N	N	20	20	S
P	76	76	N	N	5	5	E
3 R	76	76	Y	N	11	5	S
P	76	76	N	N	20	5	S
4 R	76	76	N	N	20	5	S
P	51	51	N	N	6	5	P
5 R	76	76	Y	Y	6	5	P
P	51	51	Y	N	11	5	S
6 R	76	76	Y	Y	5	5	P
P	76	76	N	Y	5	5	P
7 R	76	76	N	Y	6	5	E
P	51	51	N	N	11	5	S
8 R	51	51	Y	Y	6	5	P
P	76	76	N	Y	5	5	P
9 R	26	--	N	Y	6	11	P
P	76	--	Y	Y	11	5	S
10 R	76	76	N	Y	11	20	P
P	76	76	N	Y	5	20	P
11 R	--	76	Y	Y	6	5	P
P	--	76	N	Y	11	11	S
12 R	--	76	Y	Y	11	11	S
P	--	76	N	N	11	5	S
13 R	--	76	N	N	20	6	S
P	--	51	N	N	6	5	P
14 R	76	76	N	Y	20	6	P
P	76	76	--	Y	11	5	S
Totals							
R>P	3	4	5	3	6	5	3
R=P	6	8	7	10	2	7	5
R<P	2	1	1	1	6	2	6

(No=1 Yes=2) (P=1 S=2 E=3)

Percents of Students Mastering

Tables 21-26 show the percents of students rated as mastering objectives and the percents in each category of non-mastery. Non-mastery categories include "Not Yet Taught," "Taught But Not Mastered," "Needs Prerequisite Skills," and "Late Enrollment."

Data on Tables 21-26 show that:

1. When skills were not mastered, the most frequently recorded reason was, "Taught But Not Mastered."

2. Seventy-five percent or more of the students were rated as having attained mastery on --

Kindergarten

10 of 12 Language Arts Skills
4 of 4 Affective Education Skills
8 of 9 Mathematics Skills

Grade 1

7 of 13 Language Arts Skills
3 of 5 Affective Skills
6 of 10 Mathematics Skills

Grade 2

8 of 12 Language Arts Skills
3 of 5 Affective Skills
2 of 10 Mathematics Skills

Grade 3

2 of 13 Language Arts Skills
3 of 5 Affective Skills
1 of 11 Mathematics Skills

Grade 4

0 of 12 Language Arts Skills
0 of 5 Affective Skills
0 of 11 Mathematics Skills

Grade 5

4 of 10 Language Arts Skills
1 of 5 Affective Skills
1 of 11 Mathematics Skills

3. In general, the number of objectives mastered by 75% or more of the students decreased as the grade increased. Grade 4 is particularly outstanding as there were no objectives at this level which were mastered by 75% or more of the students.

Teachers' Ratings of Skills

Teachers were asked to rate the essential skills as being "Too Easy," "Appropriate," Too Hard," or "Unclear--Needs an Example." In addition, teachers were asked to indicate if "Instructional Strategies," "Work Sheets," and/or "Tests" would assist them in teaching the skills and rating students. Eighteen counselors from across the city also rated the Affective Education Skills. These ratings by skill by grade are presented in Appendix A of this report. An overview of the findings follows:

Language Arts Skills

All Language Arts Skills in Kindergarten and Grades 1-5 were deemed to be at the appropriate level of difficulty by all or a majority of the teachers. Several Grade 3 skills were rated as being too difficult by more than one teacher.

Affective Education Skills

While the majority of teachers rated the Affective Education Skills at all grades as being of an appropriate difficulty level, there were many instances, especially at the lower grades, where teachers indicated that the skills were unclear and in need of examples.

Mathematics Skills

All Mathematics Skills at all levels were deemed to be at an appropriate level of difficulty. Specific skills at Kindergarten and Grade 3 were rated as either too easy or too difficult by more than one teacher.

When asked about needs related to instruction and assessment of objectives, teachers indicated that for both Language Arts and Mathematics the greatest need was for "Instructional Materials" followed by "Work Sheets." Also needed, but to a lesser degree, were "Tests" followed by "Instructional Strategies."

Teachers indicated that for Affective Education skills the greatest need was for "Instructional Materials." Other areas, presented in descending order of need, were "Instructional Strategies," "Work Sheets," and "Tests."

The reader who wishes to obtain information on specific skills is directed to Appendix A.

Table 21

Objective Mastery
Percents of Teacher Ratings
Kindergarten
n=60

Objective	Mastery			Non-Mastery											
				Not Yet Taught			Taught But Not Mastered			Needs Prerequiste			Late Enrollment		
	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %
1	78	93	92				5	7	8						
2	93	88	95				7	12	5	2					
3	88	92	98				10	8	2	2					
4	93	95	98				7	5	2	2					
5	82		95				17		3	2					
6	80		58			30	18		10						
7	73		83				25		15						
8	85		87				15		13						
9	87		92				13		8						
10	75						25								
11	63			10			27								
12	93						23								
13															

Sums less than 100% are due to missing data

Table 22

Objective Mastery
Percents of Teacher Ratings
Grade 1
n=70

Objective	Mastery			Non-Mastery											
				Not Yet Taught			Taught But Not Mastered			Needs Prerequisite			Late Enrollment		
	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %
1	80	71	56		14		17	10	43	1	1		1	1	
2	83	80	84				14	19	14	1			1		
3	71	74	90	1			26	24	9				1		
4	60	97	64	1	14		37		33				1	1	
5	64	81	83				33	3	16				1		
6	80		81				17		14			1	1		1
7	86		63				11		31			1	1		1
8	77		70				20		23			1	1		1
9	67		90				33		7						1
10	56		77				43		20						1
11	74						23						1		
12	86						11								
13	99														

Table 23

Objective Mastery
Percents of Teacher Ratings
Grade 2
n=90

Objective	Mastery			Non-Mastery											
				Not Yet Taught			Taught But Not Mastered			Needs Prerequisite			Late Enrollment		
	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %
1	86	84	59				13	13	34	1					3
2	83	70	74				16	29	19						3
3	80	66	84				18	33	12	2	1				
4	73	80	62				23	18	33	2					1
5	84	90	83				13		12	2					1
6	81		70				18		27	1		1			
7	83		46				16		48	1					
8	73		62				26		30	1					3
9	62		66				37		30	1					1
10	73		47			22	26		27						1
11	92			1			7								
12	82						18								
13															

Table 24

Objective Mastery
Percents of Teacher Ratings
Grade 3
n=70

Objective	Mastery			Non-Mastery											
				Not Yet Taught			Taught But Not Mastered			Needs Prerequisite			Late Enrollment		
	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %
1	51	80	31	27		54	19	13	11	3	6				
2	66	77	59			1	31	16	37	3	6				
3	63	67	79				34	26	20	3	6				
4	63	81	43				36	13	56		4				
5	67	54	53				30	40	46	1	4				
6	87		66				11		33	1					
7	61		51				34		46	4					
8	51		59				44		40	4					
9	31		60	14			54		37			1			
10	57		40			13	41		46	1					
11	56		60			13	40		24	4					
12	76						21			3					
13	54						41			1					

Table 25

Objective Mastery
Percents of Teacher Ratings
Grade 4
n=60

Objective	Mastery			Non-Mastery											
				Not Yet Taught			Taught But Not Mastered			Needs Prerequisite			Late Enrollment		
	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %
1	40	72	18			63	58	15	12	2		5			2
2	60	63	45				21	28	48	5	7	5			
3	53	57	73				40	28	20	7	15	5			
4	50	67	43			15	45	27	25	5	7	12			3
5	53	65	38			17	43	25	43	3	10	2			
6	62		70				32		13	7		13			3
7	68		32				15		60	7		8			
8	68		43	1			27		53	2		3			
9	40		45			12	53		28	2		12			3
10	50		57				43			5		13			3
11	52		35			12	43			3		7			
12	63						35								
13															

Table 26

Objective Mastery
Percents of Teacher Ratings
Grade 5
n=70

Objective	Mastery			Non-Mastery											
				Not Yet Taught			Taught But Not Mastered			Needs Prerequisite			Late Enrollment		
	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %	Lang %	Aff %	Math %
1	79	56	36			29	20	40	34		1	1			
2	71	74	54				27	21	41			3			1
3	67	61	39				30	33	59		1	1			1
4	84	59	23			29	21	37	46			1			
5	84	77	44		13		14	6	50			1			1
6	84		80				13		20						
7	67		57				30		37			4			1
8	56		40				43		56			3			1
9	63		40			14	36		43			3			
10	70		56			14	29		30						
11			67						30						1
12															
13															

Citywide Test Scores

Tables 27-29 present citywide test score data for students proposed for retention and students citywide.

a. MEAP

Table 27 presents attainments on the Michigan Educational Assessment Program (MEAP) test administered to students in the Fall of Grade 4. MEAP scores are presented both as the number of objectives attained and the Category of Achievement with Category 1 indicating mastery of approximately 0-24 percent of the objectives, Category 2 mastery of 25-49 percent, Category 3, 50-74 percent, and Category 4, 75-100 percent.

An analysis of reading objective attainments for the eight Grade 4 students proposed for retention shows that one student is in Category 1, 3 are in Category 2 and 4 are in Category 4. For mathematics, one student is in Category 1, 1 is in Category 3 and 6 are in Category 4.

When teacher ratings of attainments of reading Essential Skills are considered, of those in MEAP Reading Category 4, 2 were rated as having mastered 0 Essential Skills, 1 mastered 2 of the 12 skills and 1 mastered 3 of the 12 skills. Students in MEAP Mathematics Category 4 were rated as having attained 0, 1 or 3 of the mathematics Essential Skills.

A content review of the MEAP objectives and the Essential Skills for Grade 4 mathematics indicates that the Essential Skills are at a higher difficulty level than the MEAP objectives. For example, while the MEAP tests multiplication of a two digit number by "1," the Essential Skills require the multiplication of two 2-digit numbers. It must be remembered that while the MEAP assesses skills which were to be learned prior to entry in Grade 4, the Essential Skills purport to identify skills required for exit from Grade 4. The Essential Skills in reading appear to more closely paralleled the Grade 4 MEAP objectives.

b. CAT

When Fall, 1987 Grade 3 California Achievement Test results are examined (Table 28) it is seen that the students proposed for retention have a Grade Mean Equivalent 2 months below the citywide mean in reading and 5 months below in mathematics. In reading and mathematics, two of the six students scored above the city mean and national norm. At Grade 5, all three students are below the city mean for both reading and mathematics.

Table 27

Michigan Educational Assessment Program (MEAP)
Fall 1987, Grade 4
Number of Objectives Mastered and Category of Attainment
Essential Skills Attainments as Rates by Teachers
Grade 4 Students Recommended for Retention

Student	Attainments					
	Objectives		Category		Essential Skills	
	R*	M*	R	M	R	M
1	12	24	2	4	0	0
2	10	19	2	3	0	3
3	25	27	4	4	0	0
4	0	0	1	1	0	2
5	19	25	4	4	3	1
6	7	22	2	4	3	1
7	21	26	4	4	2	1
8	21	27	4	4	0	3
Percent in Category 4			50.0	75.0		
City			71.0	85.3		

*25 Reading Objectives Tested
*28 Mathematics Objectives

Table 28

California Achievement Tests
Fall 1987, Grade 3 and 5
Grade Mean Equivalents and Essential
Skill Attainments as Rated by Teachers
Grades 3 and 5 Students Recommended for Retention

Grade and Student	Grade Mean Equivalents		Essential Skills	
	R	M	R	M
Grade 3				
1	1.9	1.7	0	3
2	NA	NA	0	0
3	3.0	3.6	1	0
4	3.9	3.1	0	1
5	4.0	5.2	5	4
6	2.7	2.9	1	3
Sample Mean*	2.9	3.0	1.2	1.8
Citywide Mean	3.1	3.5		
National Norm	3.2	3.2		
Grade 5				
1	3.5	4.7	1	6
2	3.0	3.9	0	0
3	2.8	2.6	2	0
Sample Mean*	3.1	3.8	1.0	2.0
Citywide Mean	4.9	5.3		
National Norm	5.2	5.2		

Note: Means are calculated using scale scores and are not, therefore, a mean of means.

c. ABCS

The Assessment of Basic Curriculum Skills (ABCS) Tests were analyzed for students proposed for retention who had taken the test. Table 29 shows the comparison in percents of retained students and citywide students mastering each objective. Grade 5 was omitted from the table as the sample of two retained students with test scores was too small for comparison.

Objectives are arranged so that those where the percent of retained students attaining mastery is equal to or greater than the percents citywide are in the left column. The right column contains objectives for which greater percents of citywide students attained mastery. Data on Table 29 indicate that, in general, retained students performed at substantially lower levels than did students citywide. Notable exceptions (objectives on which retained students performed at levels equal to or better than students citywide) include:

Reading

Grade 2 - Vocabulary
Grade 3 - Vocabulary
Grade 4 - Sequence

Writing

Grade 1 - First Name
First/Last Name
Conventions

Grade 2 - First/Last Name
Address
Sentence Development

Grade 3 - First/Last Name
Address
Sentence Development

Grade 4 - Sentence Development

Mathematics

Grade 1 - Measurement

Grade 3 - Estimation
Geometry
Measurement

Table 29

Assessment of Basic Curriculum Skills (ABCS) Tests
Retained Students Compared to Citywide

Retained Greater Than or Equal to Citywide			Retained Less Than Citywide		
Objective	Retained%	City%	Objective	Retained%	City%
			Grade 1 - Retained n=11		
			Reading - 8 Objectives		
			Decoding	64	90
			Reality	27	67
			Main Idea	9	35
			Details	18	75
			Sequence	27	64
			Generalizing	73	90
			Conclusions	18	46
			Inference	18	57
			Writing - 4 Objectives		
First Name	100	96			
F/Last Name	100	93			
			Sent. Dev.	50	78
Conventions	71	67			
			Mathematics - 9 Objectives		
			Operations	27	57
			Numeration	18	64
			Estimation	18	48
			Patterns	27	58
			Geometry	55	67
Measurement	82	80			
			Sets/Logic	82	86
			Funct./Rel.	9	41
			Stat. Prob	64	71
			Grade 2 - Retained n=9		
			Reading - 9 Objectives		
Vocabulary	100	94			
			Reality	33	92
			Main Idea	33	72
			Details	50	81
			Sequence	17	46
			Cause/Effect	50	89
			Generalizing	50	90
			Conclusions	33	60
			Inference	17	68

Table 29 (Cont'd)

Assessment of Basic Curriculum Skills (ABCS) Tests
Retained Students Compared to Citywide

Retained Greater Than or Equal to Citywide			Retained Less Than Citywide		
Objective	Retained%	City%	Objective	Retained%	City%
Writing - 7 Objectives					
F/L Name	100	97			
Address	100	89			
Sent. Dev.	83	81			
			Conventions	50	65
			Spelling	78	92
Mathematics - 9 Objectives					
			Operations	33	72
			Numeration	33	42
			Estimation	33	56
			Patterns	33	53
			Geometry	67	79
			Measurement	33	77
			Sets/Logic	56	71
			Funct./Rel.	44	64
			Stat. Prob	78	87
Grade 3 - Retained n=6 **Reading - 9 objectives**					
Vocabulary	100	94			
			Reality	33	92
			Main Idea	33	72
			Details	50	81
			Sequence	17	46
			Cause/Effect	50	89
			Generalizing	50	90
			Conclusions	33	60
			Inference	17	68
Writing - 7 Objectives					
F/L Name	100	98			
Address	100	89			
City/State	100	86			
			Sent. Dev.	50	71
			Conventions	0	56
			Spelling	33	76
			Gram./Usage	17	50

Table 29 (Cont'd)

Assessment of Basic Curriculum Skills (ABCS) Tests
Retained Students Compared to Citywide

Retained Greater Than or Equal to Citywide			Retained Less Than Citywide		
Objective	Retained%	City%	Objective	Retained%	City%
			Mathematics - 9 Objectives		
			Operations	17	46
			Numeration	0	56
Estimation	50	32			
			Patterns	33	48
Geometry	67	52			
Measurement	67	49			
			Sets/Logic	50	71
			Funct./Rel.	33	35
			Stat. Prob	17	36
			Grade 4 - Retained n=5		
			Reading - 9 Objectives		
			Vocabulary	40	78
			Reality	0	46
			Main Idea	60	68
			Details	40	62
Sequence	60	60			
			Cause/Effect	40	82
			Generalizing	40	60
			Conclusions	60	62
			Inference	20	59
			Writing - 5 Objectives		
Sent. Dev.	100	69			
			Conventions	40	59
			Spelling	0	51
			Gram./Usage	20	65
			Paragraph	40	65
			Mathematics - 9 Objectives		
			Operations	0	39
			Numeration	0	25
			Estimation	20	38
			Patterns	0	26
			Geometry	0	37
			Measurement	20	51
			Sets/Logic	0	26
			Funct./Rel.	0	29
			Stat. Prob	0	38

Table 30 shows a student by student presentation of the number and percent of skills rated as attained on the Essential Skills Check List and as measured by the ABCS Tests. For purposes of this comparison, the reading and writing objectives on the ABCS Tests have been combined to form a set of skills more comparable to the Essential Skills for Language Arts.

When percents of objectives mastered are compared it is seen that, in general, students were rated as having mastered a lower percent of skills on the Essential Skills Check List than on the ABCS Tests.

The number of students who attained Essential Skill Ratings equal to or greater than ABCS mastery scores are shown below for all cases where complete data were available.

Grade 1 n=11	
Language Arts	3
Mathematics	4
Grade 2 n=9	
Language Arts	3
Mathematics	2
Grade 3 n=6	
Language Arts	0
Mathematics	1
Grade 4 n=5	
Language Arts	1
Mathematics	4
Grade 5 n=2	
Language Arts	1
Mathematics	2

Table 30

Number and Percent of Essential Skills and ABCS Objectives Mastered

Grade	Student	Essential Skills				ABCS			
		Lang Arts		Math		Lang Arts (R & W)		Math	
		n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
1	1	5	39	4	40	9	81	5	56
1	2	3	23	0	0	1	9	4	44
1	3	4	31	9	90	4	36	2	22
1	4	5	39	3	30	4	36	2	22
1	5	4	31	3	30	5	46	4	44
1	6	6	46	8	80	5	46	5	56
1	7	3	23	1	10	4	36	0	0
1	8	3	23	4	40	10	91	7	78
1	9	4	31	0	0	7	64	5	56
1	10	2	15	0	0	3	27	6	67
1	11	2	15	0	0	3	27	2	22
2	1	8	67	7	70	12	80	8	89
2	2	3	25	2	20	5	33	5	56
2	3	1	8	0	0	3	20	2	22
2	4	3	25	0	0	3	20	0	0
2	5	2	17	0	0	2	13	1	11
2	6	6	50	7	70	10	67	3	33
2	7	4	33	2	20	11	73	8	89
2	8	9	75	4	40	13	87	7	78
2	9	8	67	0	0	5	33	3	33

Table 30 (Cont'd)

Number and Percent of Essential Skills and ABCS Objectives Mastered

Grade	Student	Essential Skills				ABCS			
		Lang Arts		Math		Lang Arts (R & W)		Math	
		n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
3	1	5	39	4	36	7	47	6	67
3	2	0	0	0	0	3	20	2	22
3	3	0	0	3	27	5	33	0	0
3	4	0	0	1	9	9	60	3	33
3	5	1	8	0	0	11	73	5	56
3	6	1	8	3	27	7	47	4	44
4	1	2	17	1	9	9	64	0	0
4	2	0	0	0	0	3	21	1	11
4	3	0	0	3	27	5	36	1	11
4	4	3	25	1	9	2	14	0	0
4	5	3	25	1	9	9	64	0	0
5	1	1	10	6	55	7	50	0	0
5	2	2	20	0	0	1	7	0	0

Spearman Rank Order Correlation Coefficients were used to assess the difference between the ranks of the paired observations for Essential Skill ratings and ABCS mastery data for Language Arts and similarly for mathematics. The coefficients which result are to be interpreted on a scale from -1.000 (perfect inverse correlation) to 0.000 (no correlation) to +1.000 (perfect correlation). The coefficients are presented on Table 30.1 below for kindergarten through Grade 4. Grade 5 was omitted because of the extremely small number of students (2).

Table 30.1

Spearman Rank Order Coefficients

Grade	Language Arts	Mathematics
1	.5189	.0477
2	.8432	.7175
3.	.3914	.2648
4	.0811	.0000

Grade 2 language arts is the only area for which a sufficiently high coefficient (over .80) was obtained. This indicates that Grade 2 students performed similarly in language arts as rated by the two instruments.

Teachers' Questionnaires

Teachers were asked to indicate the amount of time required to complete the ratings for one student. Results are shown in Table 31. Times are shown for self-contained teachers (completed rating forms in all three areas), for platoon teachers who completed language arts and affective ratings, and for platoon teachers who completed mathematics ratings.

Table 31

Time Required Per Student

Areas Rated	Number	Minutes	
		Range	Mean
Self-Contained (3 Areas)	29	3-20	7.6
Platoon (Language Arts and Affective)	8	2-12	6.4
Platoon (Mathematics)	6	3-10	6.2

As shown on Table 31, teachers in self-contained classrooms who completed rating forms in three areas required more time than did platoon teachers. These self-contained teachers indicated that it took approximately 8 minutes per student whereas platoon teachers required just over 6 minutes per form. The range indicates that task completion for individual teachers took from 2-20 minutes.

When asked to indicate weather their school's language arts and mathematics curriculum was less than, nearly identical to, or broader than the essential skills, 56% of the responding teachers indicated that the school's curriculum was "nearly identical" and 44% indicated that it was "broader."

Teachers were also asked to compare the school's language arts and mathematics curriculum to the District's curriculum known as the "Strands and Objectives." (The Strands and Objectives were reviewed during the original inservice session.) Of the responding teachers, 68% indicated that the schools curriculum was "nearly identical," 32% indicated that the schools curriculum was "broader."

It is notable that nearly the same percents indicated that the curriculum of the school was nearly identical to both the Essential Skills and the Strands and Objectives. Since the Essential Skills are intended to be a subset of the Strands and Objectives, one would expect that if the school's curriculum was identical to the Strands and Objectives that that same curriculum would be identified as broader than the Essential Skills. These confounded data could be the result of a misunderstanding of the terms "Essential Skills" and "Strands and Objectives."

When asked if their school had a promotion/retention policy, teachers in 2 buildings unanimously answered "yes." In the other buildings responses were split between "Yes," "In Process," "No," and "Don't Know". In total, 26 teachers responded "Yes," 11 responded "In Process," 8 responded "No," 1 responded "Don't Know," and 2 did not respond.

When asked if their school had a procedure for keeping track of skills in the affective area, teachers in two buildings unanimously responded "No." In the other three buildings responses were split between "Yes" and "No." In all, 14 teachers responded "Yes," 27 teachers responded "No."

When asked the degree to which the affective education skills on the Essential Skills Check List are related to the citizenship marks given to students, 1 teacher responded "Not at All," 34 said "Somewhat," and 12 said "Completely,"

Teachers were asked the degree to which the Essential Skills Check List would help them in certain ways. Responses are shown below.

To what degree would the Essential Learning Skills Check List help you ---

	Not at All	Somewhat	Quite a Bit
a. make promotion decisions?	3 (6%)	31 (66%)	13 (28%)
b. counsel parents and students?	3 (6%)	24 (51%)	20 (43%)
c. support promotion decisions?	1 (2%)	30 (64%)	16 (34%)

Over one-half of the respondents feel that the check list would be somewhat helpful in all three areas. Over one-fourth of the respondents feel that it would be quite useful, especially in the counseling of parents and students where 43% indicated likewise.

Teachers were asked to indicate the one group out of 6 for whom completion of the check list would be most appropriate. Responses were:

All Students	45%
Students receiving Chapter 1 or Article 3 services	4%
Bilingual students	0
Special Education students	0
Students considered for retention	47%
Others (Listed by respondents as those with special learning, social, or emotional problems).	4%

Teachers were asked to identify what they currently use to decide promotion and retention and what actions they take before retaining a student.

Responses indicate that teachers primarily use some assessment of subject matter mastery. Other factors mentioned include age, maturity, work habits/social habits, attendance, and class participation.

Actions taken include informing parents, adjusting instruction, counseling students, providing extra homework, assessing eligibility for Chapter 1 and Article 3 programs, reteaching, and tutoring. By far the most frequently given response was related to notification of parents as to the possibility of retention.

A complete listing of teacher responses is provided in Appendix B.

Summary and Conclusions

Broadly stated conclusions and findings of the study are presented in narrative form; a listing of specifics follows the narrative.

Data indicate that males are more likely to be retained than females. Students proposed for retention are also frequently proposed for special education and special projects (Chapter 1 and Article 3) services; about one half of the retained students received the latter services.

Students proposed for retention exhibited poorer attendance, citizenship, and attainment of Essential Skills than did students proposed for promotion. Within the subject areas of reading and mathematics, there were discernible "cut levels" above which students were only promoted. However, depending upon the grade and subject area, the cut level could range from mastery of just a few objectives to mastery of nearly all of them. When the percents of students mastering individual skills within each subject area were examined, it was found that the number of skills for which 75% or more of the students received mastery ratings was quite low. In fact, in some cases zero skills fit the criteria. A review of students' achievements on citywide tests indicated a lack of correlation between test scores and retention recommendations.

Teachers felt that the majority of Essential Skills were appropriate but that additional instructional materials would be helpful. There was some indication that staff are not fully aware of their schools' promotion/retention policies and the relationship of the Strands and Objectives to their schools' curriculum and the Essential Skills. They also indicated currently using some type of subject matter mastery assessment to make promotion decisions. "Instructional Adjustments" were less frequently mentioned than "Notification of Parents" as actions taken before student retention is a fait accompli.

A more specific list of the findings is presented below:

1. Males are nearly twice as likely to be retained as are females.

2. Of students proposed for retention, all of whom attend schools which received Article 3 services, 54% received such services. Of the 46% who did not receive Article 3 services, not one was listed on their school's "Article 3 Ranked Student List."

3. Three students (6.5%) of those proposed for retention carry a Hispanic ethnic code. One of these students is serviced by a bilingual program. Hispanic students appear to be more highly represented in the retained group than are students who carry other ethnic codes. Caution should be used in interpreting these data because of the small number of Hispanic students in the sample.

4. Over ten percent (10.9%) of the students proposed for retention had been suspended one time. This is in contrast to 3.3% of the students proposed for promotion who had been suspended 1, 2, or 3 times.

5. Over twenty-three percent (23.9%) of the students proposed for retention had also been recommended for special education services.

6. Students proposed for promotion and retention had similar patterns of length of enrollment in the school and classroom.

7. There is a significant difference in the absentee rates between the two categories of students with over 70% of the retained students being absent 11 or more days and 43% of the promoted students being similarly absent.

8. Citizenship ratings are poorer for students proposed for retention than for those proposed for promotion. While 44% of the retained students received ratings of "Poor," only 14% of the promoted students were so rated. Conversely while 15% of the retained students were rated as "excellent," 39% of the promoted students were so rated.

9. In general, there was a significant difference in the number of Essential Skills rated as attained between the groups proposed for retention and promotion. These differences were greater for language arts and mathematics than for affective skills.

10. Students who had been <u>previously</u> retained also were rated as attaining lower numbers of objectives. This is true at all grades except for Grade 1.

11. For the entire sample, in language arts and mathematics there appears to be a "cut score" in the number of skills rated as mastered such that below the cut score students may be retained or promoted; above the cut score, students are only promoted. The cut scores vary widely by grade, ranging from mastery of 20% to 90% of the Essential Skills.

12. Within individual classrooms, 14 pairs of students were identified such that one student was designated for promotion and another for retention although the 2 students had similar ratings for skill mastery. When these pairs were examined as a sub-study entitled the "Matched Case Analysis," it was found that the retained member of the set was more likely to:

    a. Have been enrolled in the classroom for a longer period of time;

    b. Also have been recommended for Special Education;

    c. Have been previously retained;

d. Have been absent about the same number of times but tardy more frequently

e. Have been given a worse citizenship rating.

While the results related to absences and enrollment appear to contradict earlier findings related to the entire sample, these data support the notion that factors indicating that students are attending to the business of school are related to retention decisions.

13. When student attainments of individual skills were examined for the <u>entire sample</u>, it was found that:

    a. The number of skills for which 75% or more of the students attained mastery decreased as the grade increased;

    b. The number of skills for which 75% or more of the students received mastery ratings was quite low, in some cases only 2, 1 or 0 skills had over 75% of the students mastering; and

    c. When teachers indicated that students did not master objectives, the most frequently given reason was that the skill had been, "taught but not mastered."

14. Teachers rated the majority of skills as being at an appropriate difficulty level for the grade level.

15. Teachers indicated a need for "instructional materials" and "work sheets" related to the skills. Also needed, but to a lesser degree, were "tests" and "instructional strategies."

16. A review of the citywide achievement test scores attained by students proposed for retention indicates that:

    a. Grade 4 MEAP - 4 of 8 students proposed for retention were in Category 4 for the reading test, 6 of 8 for the math test. Four of the eight students were in Category 4 on both the reading and math tests.

    b. Grade 3 CAT - The group grade mean equivalent for reading was 2 months lower than the city, 3 months lower than the national norm. For mathematics, the group was 5 months below the city, 2 months below the nation.

    c. Grade 5 CAT - The group was 18 months below the city and 21 months below the nation in reading. In mathematics, the group was 15 months below the city, 14 months below the nation.

    d. ABCS - In general, retained students performed at substantially lower levels than did students citywide. There appears to be a significant relationship between retained students scores on the ABCS tests and the rating of Essential Skills mastered only for Grade 2 language arts skills.

17. Teachers spent 6 to 8 minutes completing the Essential Skill Check List for each student.

18. When asked if their school's curriculum was "broader than" the Essential Skills, 44% of the teachers indicated "Yes." Compared to the "Strands and Objectives," 32% of the teachers felt that the schools curriculum was broader. This was a subjective assessment.

19. Teachers in two buildings were unanimous in saying that their schools already had a "Retention/Promotion Policy." In the other buildings responses were split between "Yes," "No," and "In Process."

20. The majority of teachers felt that the affective education skills on the Essential Skills Check List were "Somewhat" related to citizenship marks.

21. Teachers felt that the Essential Skills Check List would be most helpful in counseling parents and students. They also felt that it would be somewhat helpful in making and supporting promotion and retention decisions.

22. Teachers felt that the Essential Skills Check List would be most appropriate for use with students considered for retention and/or all students.

23. Teachers indicated that they currently make promotion/retention decisions based on some assessment of subject matter mastery.

24. When asked to identify actions taken before retaining a student, teachers most often mentioned "notification of parents." Instructional adjustments were less frequently mentioned.

Recommendations

1. Develop strategies at each school to improve students' attendance, citizenship, and other factors related to attending to the business of school. Recommended strategies include:

   a. System-wide form letters to be sent home at the beginning of the school year informing parents of the relationship between retention and attendance, tardiness and citizenship.

   b. Letters to be sent after students have been absent or tardy for five times and at all subsequent intervals of 5.

   c. Mandated home/school contact by letter or telephone when a student's citizenship is deemed less than satisfactory.

   d. Parental conferences to accompany a, b, and c above.

2. Confer with appropriate governmental authorities to adjust Article 3 service guidelines to include students for whom test scores are not available and/or are deemed to be in need of service at a time in the school year after the original selection process has been completed.

3. Revise the Essential Skills taking into consideration teachers' perceptions and students' performance as presented in this report.

4. Develop an instructional support system to provide assistance to students who demonstrate that they may be in danger of not mastering the Essential Learning Skills.

5. Key the Essential Skills to the Detroit Strands and Objectives and provide inservice training to staff on same.

6. Provide alternative teaching strategies for retained students to insure their success.

7. Provide assistance to teachers who have students whom they feel are qualified for but who do not meet Special Education selection criteria. Such assistance may take the form of additional staff service, materials, or innovative programs to name a few possibilities.

8. Do not establish a cut-off level for skill attainment until the program model has been in operation for at least two years. This will insure that teachers have knowledge of the Essential Learning Skills and sufficient techniques to provide appropriate instruction and make valid assessments of mastery. This will also allow for the collection of sufficient baseline data to make an informed decision regarding cut-off levels.

9. Implement a set of promotion and retention criteria only if accompanied by a set of criteria for remedial actions to be taken before retention occurs.

Issues to be Addressed

Various issues need to be addressed to insure the establishment of an equitable and comprehensive promotion retention policy. Some of these issues are presented below.

1. Issues related to the making of promotion and retention decisions

    a. The promotion of students demonstrating subject matter knowledge similar to that of retained students and vice versa

    b. Informing all staff as to the presence or absence of school-wide promotion/retention policies

    c. Addressing the fact that students who were previously retained perform at lower levels than non-retained students at all grades except Grade 1

    d. Setting appropriate cut levels for Essential Skill mastery, if same is to be used for promotion/retention decisions

    e. Identifying other promotion/retention decision factors to be used with outliers, i.e., those students who score below the cut level but may be designated either for promotion or retention

2. Measurement related issues

    a. Addressing citywide test score issues related to students performing better on same than teacher ratings of Essential Skill attainments would indicate

    b. Identifying the specific, concrete data a teacher would need in order to check an Essential Skill as attained

    c. The assessment of students recommended for Special Education services

3. Issues related to instruction and failure prevention

    a. Addressing the logic of the concept that a skill can be "taught" but not mastered

    b. Identifying concrete sets of instruction based activities to be conducted when students are in a position of possible retention

c. The provision of Article 3 services to students who are potential retentions

d. Addressing the appropriateness of the Essential Skills when they are deemed by teachers to be at an appropriate difficulty level and yet low percents of students appear to be attaining them; addressing the instructional implications of same

e. Assessing what is currently being used for instruction for Essential Skills which are deemed to be:

1. At the appropriate difficulty level and

2. Taught but not mastered

but

3. In need of instructional materials

f. Providing needed instructional materials to staff

4. Issues related to cooperative efforts of home and school

a. Improving attendance

b. Decreasing tardiness

c. Improving citizenship as measured by teacher ratings and suspensions from school.

Recommendations for Future Studies

It is recommended that the 46 students identified as being "proposed for retention" in this study be followed in order to assess:

1. If they actually are retained based on the 1988-89 grade level, and

2. Their future academic and social performance on variables similar to those examined in this study.

It is also recommended that the 28 students in the Matched Case Study be followed to assess the differences between students proposed for retention and those proposed for promotion.

Appendix A

Teachers' Ratings of Skills

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: Kdg. 6 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
KINDERGARTEN/LANGUAGE ARTS								
1. (Speaking) - express full name (first, last) and address.		6			1	1	1	
2. - express ideas using Standard English.		6			3		2	1
3. - retell a previously heard simple story.		6			2	1	1	2
4. (Listening) - follow a series of two directions in sequence.		6			1	1	1	1
5. - identify main idea.		6			4	2	2	1
6. - identify sequence.		6			2	2	2	2
7. - predict most probable outcome.		6			4	2	2	1
8. - identify patterns of rhyme.		6			3	1		
9. (Pre-Reading) - identify upper and lower case printed letters.		6			1	1	1	1
10. - recognize selected beginning constant sounds in pictures and words.		6			2	2	1	1
11. - recognize selected kindergarten basal high-frequency words.		6			2	1	2	2
12. (Handwriting) - correctly write, from copy, his/her first name with appropriate capitalization.		6			1	1	1	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

18 Counselor Respondents (c)
Grade you teach: Kdg. 6 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
KINDERGARTEN/AFFECTIVE		C 16	C 2		C 15	C 12	C 9	C 5
(Self Esteem)								
1. Recognize the qualities that make self unique.		4		2	2	3	1	1
(Interpersonal Relationships)		C 15	C 1	C 2	C 14	C 13	C 8	C 3
2. Recognize ways to deal with social situations and associated feelings.		4		2	3	3	2	1
(Decision Making)		C 13	C 4	C 1	C 14	C 11	C 8	C 5
3. Recognize when a decision is needed.		4		2	3	3	2	2
(Feelings)		C 15	C 1	C 1	C 14	C 8	C 8	C 3
4. Match two feelings with appropriate related situations.		5		1	3	3	2	1

79

89

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: Kdg. 6 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
KINDERGARTEN/MATHEMATICS								
1. (Functions/Relations) Compare two sets of objects, no greater than 10.		6			1	1	2	1
2. (Geometry) Identify geometric shapes (circle, square, triangle).	2	4			1	3	1	1
3. (Measurement) Identify an object as tall, short, long, big, small or little.		6			1	1	1	1
4. (Numeration) - Count by rote to 10.	3	3			1	3	1	1
5. - Count objects to demonstrate one-to-one correspondence to 10.		6			1	1	1	1
6. - Partition a set of objects (keep track of what has been counted and what needs to be counted.		4		2	1	1	1	1
7. - Identify cardinal number of a set.		6			1	1	1	1
8. (Patterns) Duplicate a pattern of geometric figures according to one attribute.		6			2	1	2	1
9. (Sets and Logic) Sort and classify objects according to one attribute (color, shape, or size).		6			2	1	2	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 1 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 1/LANGUAGE ARTS								
(Speaking) 1. - express ideas and opinions on a topic using Standard English.		7						
2. - retell the events of a previously heard simple story in sequence.		7					1	1
(Listening) 3. - listen to a story or passage and select the answer to a literal question. (Literal Details)		6	1		3	2	1	1
4. - listen to a story or passage and select the answer to an inference question. (Inferred Details)		6	1		3	1	1	1
5. - listen to a story or passage and select the main idea. (Literal Main Idea)		7			2		1	1
6. - follow three directions in sequence without having them repeated. (Sequence)		7				1		

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 1 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 1/LANGUAGE ARTS								
(Reading)								
7. - select an initial or final consonant that represents the sound of the given picture. (Vocabulary)		7			1	1	1	1
8. - identify specific Primary Unit I high frequency words (from Houghton Mifflin reading, Dolch 220, Fry's 600). (Vocabulary)		7					1	1
9. - select from four sentences the one that best describes the picture. (Literal Details)		7			2		1	1
10. - select from four statements the one which presents the main idea that most clearly expresses the action suggested by the selection. (Literal Main Idea)	1	5		1	2	1	1	1
(Writing)								
11. - select words from a word list to write a simple sentence with appropriate capitalization and end punctuation.		7					1	
(Handwriting)								
12. - demonstrate the use of correct manuscript letter forms with appropriate spacing.		7						
13. - correctly write first and last name using manuscript letter forms		7						

85

86

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

19 Counselor Respondents (C)
Grade you teach: 1 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appropriate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 1/AFFECTIVE								
(Self Esteem) 1. Describe positive qualities and characteristics of themselves and of one other person (classmate, teacher, family member, etc.).		C 17 6	1	C 2	C 16 3	C 10 3	C 11 1	C 5 1
(Interpersonal Relationships) 2. Recognize situations which are/are not to be reported to an adult.		C 15 6	C 2	C 2 1	C 11 2	C 9 1	C 7 1	C 4 1
(Decision Making) 3. Recognize when a decision is needed and give some alternatives.		C 14 5	C3 1	1	C 12 3	C 11 1	C 8 1	C 6 1
(Feelings) 4. Match facial representations of feeling happy, sad, and upset with appropriate situations represented by pictures.		C 18 7			C 14 1	C 8 1	C 9 1	C 6 1
(Values) 5. Given pictures that demonstrate value concepts such as honesty, sharing, and kindness, students will be able to describe the concept being shown.		C 14 6	C 4 1	C 1	C 14 2	C 10 2	C 10 1	C 7 1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 1 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 1/MATHEMATICS								
(Estimation) 1. Choose the set that is closest to a given number by estimating. (Use no more than four sets of objects).		6	1		4	1	2	3
(Functions/Relations) 2. Compare and order by size or capacity a set of three objects or pictures.		7			1			
(Geometry) 3. Identify and draw geometric figures (circle, triangle, square, rectangle).		7						
(Measurement) 4. Estimate and measure the length of an object or distance using non-standard units.		7			1			
(Numeration) 5. Interpret and/or illustrate the meaning of whole numbers 0 through 50.		7			1			

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 1 — 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appropriate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 1/MATHEMATICS								
(Operations) 6. Demonstrate the meaning of addition and subtraction.		7			1	1	1	1
7. Solve addition and subtraction problems with sums to eighteen.		7			1			
(Patterns) 8. Duplicate and extend a pattern of color, shape, or size using objects or pictures.		7			1		2	1
(Sets and Logic) 9. Classify objects by color, shape or size. (1 or 2 attributes)		7			1		1	1
(Probability/Statistics) 10. Interpret a pictograph, with one-to-one ratio, to determine relationships of "most", "more", "less", "least", "equal to", and "only".		6	1		2	1	2	2

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study .
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 2 9 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 2/LANGUAGE ARTS								
(Speaking)								
1. - participate in group discussions.	1	7		1	2		1	1
2. - tell of an experience using descriptive details and Standard English.		9			2	1	1	
(Listening)								
3. - listen to a story or passage and identify the literal main idea and supporting details (Main Idea, Details)		9			2	1	3	1
4. - listen to a story or passage and provide answers to inference questions. (Inferred Details)		9			2	1	3	1
5. - listen to a story or passage and identify the event that occurred first, second and last. (Sequence)		9			1		2	2
(Reading)								
6. - select the initial or final consonant blend or digraph for a given picture. (Vocabulary-Clusters)		9			1		1	1
7. - identify specific Primary Unit II high frequency words (from Houghton Mifflin Reading, Dolch, Fry's 600). (Vocabulary)		9			1		4	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 2 9 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 2/LANGUAGE ARTS								
8.- use contextual factors to select the synonym for an underlined word. (Vocabulary)		9			2		2	2
9.- select answers to literal questions related to the content of a selection in the areas of main idea, details, and sequence. (Inference)		8		1	2	1	3	2
(Literature) 10.- identify character traits, setting, and plot of a story.		8	1		1		2	2
(Writing) 11.- write his/her first and last name, house number and street using uniform numbers and correctly formed upper and lower case manuscript.		9			1		1	1
12.- use words from a word bank to write a sentence expressing an idea about the picture.	1	8			2		1	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

19 Counselor Respondents (C)
Grade you teach: 2 9 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 2/AFFECTIVE								
(Self Esteem) 1. Recognize and identify differences between self and others.		C 18 7	C 1	2	C 11 5	C 10 1	C 9 2	C 6 2
(Interpersonal Relationships) 2. Recognize social norms that encourage or discourage friendship.		C 14 9	C 1	C 3	C 17 6	C 11 2	C 12 3	C 6 2
(Decision Making) 3. Recognize when a decision is needed and identify the advantages and disadvantages of alternatives.		C 13 9	C 4		C 13 7	C 10 2	C 9 4	C 5 2
(Feelings) 4. Identify different feelings for selected situations.		C 18 9			C 12 5	C 7 1	C 8 2	C 3 2
(Values) 5. Identify value words such as fair, kind, honest and nice appearing in a story read aloud by the teacher.		C 18 9	C 1		C 11 6	C 7 2	C 9 3	C 6 2

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 2 9 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 2/MATHEMATICS								
(Estimation) 1. Choose the set that is closest to a given number by estimating. (Multiples of ten less than 100).		9			6	1	4	3
(Functions/Relations) 2. Identify the relationship and/or symbol (addition, subtraction, greater than, less than, or equal to) between sets and/or whole numbers (less than 100).		9			4		2	2
(Geometry) 3. Identify or draw congruent or similar geometric figures (circle, triangle, square, rectangle, open and closed figures) and describe their properties.	1	8			4		2	2
(Measurement) 4. Estimate and determine the length or height of an object or distance using a standard unit.		8	1		4		2	2
(Numeration) 5. Interpret, illustrate, read, and/or write whole numbers and their place value 0 through 99, with or without aids.		8	1		4		2	2

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 2 9 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 2/MATHEMATICS								
(Operations) 6. Add and subtract whole numbers and money amounts through two digits (addition-with or without regrouping; subtraction-without grouping.	1	8			4		2	2
7. Apply mental arithmetic strategies to solve addition and subtraction problems.		6	1	1	5	2	2	1
(Patterns) 8. Interpret and extend a pattern of geometric figures and/or numbers.		9			4	1	4	2
(Probability/Statistics) 9. Interpret and construct bar graphs.		9			3	1	3	2
(Sets and Logic) 10. Interpret and construct a Venn diagram (1 or 2 sets)		7	1	1	3	2	3	2

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 3 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 3\LANGUAGE ARTS								
(Speaking) 1. - state an opinion and supply three supporting statements that defend it using Standard English.		5	2		3	1	1	1
(Listening) 2. - listen to a passage and select from four phrases the one that expresses author's purpose. (Inference)		6	1		3		2	1
3. - select relevant or irrelevant statements that relate to a specific topic.		6	1		1		1	1
(Reading) 4. - select from four phrases the inferred detail that supports the stated main idea of a selection. (Inference)		5	2		1		1	1
5. - use contextual factors to select the synonym or antonym for an underlined word. (Vocabulary)		7			1		1	1
6. - select from four phrases the one that makes the best ending for a sentence. (Cause and Effect Relationships)		7			1		1	1
7. - select answers to inference questions related to the main idea, details, or sequence of a selection. (Inferred Main Idea, Details, Sequence)		6	1		1		1	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 3 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 3\LANGUAGE ARTS								
8. - select from four literal statements the meaning of a given figure of speech. (Vocabulary-Similies)		7			2	1	2	1
(Literature) 9. - read a passage and identify statements as begin either dialogue or narrative.		5	2		1		2	1
(Writing) 10. - read information about a topic and write three literal facts (details) about the topic.		5	2		2		2	2
(Spelling) 11. - use syllabication and pronunciation aids to correctly spell words with vowels, dipthongs and contractions.		5	1	1	1		1	1
12. - identify the two letters needed to complete the correct spelling of a word (selected from the third grade approved spelling text) in context.		7			1		1	1
(Handwriting) 13. - correctly form upper and lower case cursive letters.		7			1		1	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 3

19 Counselor Respondents (C)
7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appropriate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 3/AFFECTIVE		C 19			C 7	C 8	C 5	C 3
(Self-Esteem) 1. Participate in assigned classroom responsibilities.	1	6			2	1	2	
(Interpersonal Relationships) 2. Recognize that there may be more than one point of view.		C 17 6	C 1	C 1 1	C 12 2	C 12 1	C 9 2	C 5
(Decision Making) 3. Recognize when a decision is needed, the advantages and disadvantages of alternatives and evaluate those alternatives.		C 15 6	C 2	C 2 1	C 15 2	C 11 1	C 11 2	C 5
(Feelings) 4. Recognize the feelings of others i.e., anger, happiness, upset.	1	C 19 6			C 9 2	C 8 1	C 10 2	C 4
(Values) 5. Recognize that people hold certain beliefs and establish certain behavior patterns.		C 13 7	C 3	C 3	C 13 2	C 11 1	C 11 2	C 4

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 3 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 3/MATHEMATICS								
(Calculators) 1. Identify and use appropriate calculator keys and interpret the calculator display (+,-,×,÷,=, numbers).		5			3	2	4	2
(Estimation) 2. Estimate sums or differences (sums less than 1,000, money and word problems).		7			1		2	2
(Functions/Relations) 3. Order whole numbers, less than 1,000, from least to greatest and vice versa (with or without models).		7			2		2	2
(Geometry) 4. Identify models and word names of a cube, cone, cylinder and sphere.		7			3	2	3	3
(Measurement) 5. Identify the reasonable customary or metric unit to estimate and measure length, height, distance and/or weight.		6	1		3	1	3	3
(Numeration) 6. Write and show (using pictures or models) whole numbers less than 1,000 in standard and/or expanded notation.	7				1		2	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 3 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appropriate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 3/MATHEMATICS								
(Operations) 7. Demonstrate the meaning of multiplication and basic facts through 9 x 9.		7			3	2	2	1
8. Subtract any whole numbers through three-digits with or without aid and/or mental arithmetic strategies.		7			1	1	2	1
(Patterns) 9. Interpret and extend a pattern of geometric figures and/or numbers.		7			2	1	2	1
(Probability/Statistics) 10. Determine the likelihood of simple events.		5	2		1	1	2	1
(Sets and Logic) 11. Identify a geometric figure or number from a given set of information.		7			1	1	2	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 4 6 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 4/LANGUAGE ARTS								
(Speaking) 1. - use a simple, written outline to give a report or retell a story using correct sequence and Standard English.		6			4	3	2	
(Listening) 2. - listen to a passage and identify three statements as being either fact or opinion. (Inference)		6			4	2	3	
(Reading) 3. - select from four sentences the one which identifies the author's purpose in a given selection. (Inference)		6			4	2	2	
4. - select from four possible definitions the meaning of a word containing an affix. (Vocabulary)		6			4	2	2	
5. - read an informational passage and select the correct response to four survey questions.		6			4	2	2	
6. - select from four sentences the logical conclusion for a reading selection. (Drawing Conclusions)		6			5	2	3	
7. - select from four titles the one which denotes the theme of a given selection. (Generalization)		6			4	2	2	

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 4 6 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 4/LANGUAGE ARTS								
(Literature) 8. - read a narrative passage and identify phrases as describing either characters, settings or events.		6			4	1	2	
(Writing) 9. - write a friendly letter for a specific purpose using the correct format (heading, greeting, body of letter, closing salutation and signature).		6			4	1	4	
(Spelling) 10. - spell words with double consonants, affixes and possessives correctly.		6			4	1	3	1
11. - correctly spell words (selected from the fourth grade approved spelling text) in context.		6			4	1	3	
(Handwriting) 12. - correctly form upper and lower case cursive letters and use them legibility in written language.		6			4	1	4	

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

19 Counselor Respondents (C)
Grade you teach: 4 6 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 4/AFFECTIVE		C 15		C 4	C 13	C 11	C 9	C 3
(Self-Esteem) 1. Demonstrate successful use of a variety of physical/motor and cognitive activities.		3		3	5	3	3	1
(Interpersonal Relationships) 2. Recognize that people react differently to the same situation.		C 19 6			C 13 4	C 12 3	C 9 3	C 4 1
(Decision Making) 3. Recognize when a decision is needed and the advantages and disadvantages of alternatives; evaluate the alternatives and make a choice based upon the evaluation.		C 17 6	C 2		C 13 4	C 11 4	C 11 3	C 4 1
(Feelings) 4. Identify emotions that affect the way people think and work.		C 16 6	C 2	C 1	C 10 4	C 10 3	C 10 2	C 3 1
(Values) 5. Demonstrate the use of: 1. Prizing and cherishing 2. Publicly affirming 3. Making choices after considering consequences 4. Freedom of choice.		C 15 6	C 1	C 3	C 13 4	C 13 4	C 11 2	C 6 1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 4 6 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 4/MATHEMATICS								
(Calculators) 1. Predict number to be displayed and verify its result.		4			4	1	4	1
(Estimation) 2. Estimate sums, differences and products, including money and word problems.		5			1	1	2	
(Functions/Relations) 3. Relate the whole number operations.		5			2	1	2	
(Geometry) 4. Identify, describe the properties and draw geometric figures (point, line segment, ray, angle, intersecting lines, parallel lines, perpendicular lines and right angles).		3	1	1	2	1	2	
(Measurement) 5. Determine the perimeter, with or without a grid, and the area of a figure on a grid.		4	1		2	1	3	1
(Numeration) 6. Identify a number that is 10, 100, or 1,000 greater or less than a given number.	1	4			1	1	2	1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 4 6 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 4/MATHEMATICS								
(Operations) 7. Demonstrate the meaning of division and the concept of fraction as the division of equal shares.		4			2	2	2	
8. Multiply any two-digit whole numbers with or without aids and/or mental arithmetic strategies.		5			2	1	2	
(Patterns) 9. State the rule used in forming a given pattern and extend the pattern.		4	1		1	1	2	
(Probability/Statistics) 10. Read and interpret tables and graphs (pictograph and bar graph).		4	1		2	2	3	1
(Sets and Logic) 11. Draw conclusions from a series of three statements, with or without aids.		4	1		3	2	4	

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 5 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 5/LANGUAGE ARTS								
(Listening) 1. - listen to an incomplete passage and select from four summary statements the best ending for the passage. (Generalizing)		7			4	2	4	3
(Speaking) 2. - formulate who, what, when, how, why, and where questions regarding information presented using Standard English.		7			3	2	3	2
(Reading) 3. - select from four statements the one which best describes the most probable cause and/or effect that can be inferred from the events in a selection (Inferred Cause and Effect Relationships)		7			4	2	4	2
4. - select from four statements the one that can be verified in the selection. (Details)		7			4	2	4	2
5. - select from four sets of four statements the one which identifies the correct sequence of events for a selection. (Sequence)	1	6			4	2	4	3
6. - identify four selection-related statements as either fact or opinion. (Levels of Reality)		6	1		3	1	4	3

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 5 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 5/LANGUAGE ARTS								
(Literature) 7. - read a passage and identify statements as being either dialogue or narrative.		7			3	1	2	2
(Writing) 8. - read an outline and use the ideas in the outline to write a two-paragraph report about the topic.		7			3	1	3	1
(Spelling) 9. - correctly spell words (selected from the fifth grade approved spelling test) in context.		7			3	1	2	2
(Handwriting) 10. - correctly form upper and lower case cursive letter legibly for all written language.	1	6			3	2	4	3

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 5

19 Counselor Respondents (C)
7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appropriate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 5/AFFECTIVE		C 17		C 2	C 15	C 12	C 10	C 4
(Self-Esteem) 1. Use self direction in academic and social experiences.		6		1	2	2	1	1
(Interpersonal Relationships) 2. Identify social support systems.		C 16 6		C 1 1	C 13 2	C 8 1	C 9 1	C 4 1
(Feelings) 3. Examine emotions caused by external sources and demonstrate responses that will avoid self-destructive behavior, i.e., restraint and control.		C 18 6		C 1	C 15 3	C 13 2	C 9 1	C 7 1
(Decision Making) 4. Recognize when a decision is needed and the advantages and disadvantages of alternatives; evaluate the alternatives, make a choice based upon the evaluation, and act upon the choices.		C 19 6			C 19 2	C 11 2	C 10 1	C 6 2
(Values) 5. Name three things that are valued and state the reasons for valuing.		C 18 6	1	C 1	C 14 2	C 11 1	C 14 2	C 5 1

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 5 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 5/MATHEMATICS								
(Calculators) 1. Determine reasonableness of display answers.		5	1		2		2	2
(Estimation) 2. Use estimation to check the reasonableness of an answer.		6			2	1	3	3
(Functions/Relations) 3. Interpret a word problem, translate the information into an appropriate number sentence and solve, using whole numbers and money.		6			2		3	3
(Geometry) 4. Identify and relate two-dimensional figures to three-dimensional figures and their properties, using models and pictures (i.e., square to cube).		6			3		3	1
(Measurement) 5. Relate and compare metric units of measure; relate and compare customary units of measure.		6			4	2	3	2

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Skill Rating Form

Grade you teach: 5 7 Teacher Respondents

Directions: For each skill listed, check one column in Section 1 and as many columns as appropriate in Section 2.

Essential Learning Skills	Section 1: For this grade, the objective is --- (Check one.)				Section 2: Do you have adequate materials to teach and rate students on the objective? If not, what would assist you? (Check all that apply.)			
	Too Easy	Appro-priate	Too Hard	Unclear --- Needs an Example	Instructional Materials	Instructional Strategies	Work Sheets	Tests
GRADE 5/MATHEMATICS								
(Numeration) 6. Interpret, illustrate, read and/or write rational numbers with or without aids. (decimals through hundredths; selected fractions with denominators no greater than 12.)		6			2	1	3	3
(Operations) 7. Divide whole numbers by one or two-digit divisors, with or without aids and/or mental arithmetic strategies.		5	1		2	1	2	2
8. Find, compare and order equivalent fractions, with or without aids.		6			3	2	3	3
(Patterns) 9. Create a pattern of geometric shapes and/or numbers (including rational numbers)		5		1	2	1	3	3
(Probability/Statistics) 10. Use data to construct and/or select a table or graph that fits given information (pictograph, bar, and line graphs).	1	5			3	2	3	3
(Sets and Logic) 11. Classify numbers according to given attributes odd, even, multiples, divisors (factors).		6			2	1	2	2

Appendix B

Teachers' Comments

Question #13: What do you currently use to decide promotion and retention?

1. Grades, mastery of skills, effort put forth in work
2. Teacher judgment - Daily work of student oral written test scores, attendance, records
3. Language arts and math
4. Classroom assignments
5. Test results from various subjects, oral discussion
6. Grades (report card) - reading, math citizenship
7. Test scores, classwork
8. According to Area policy, I am not allowed to retain children in kdg.
9. "Must be able to read": 80% mastery of decoding skills, vocabulary, comprehension. Math - must be able to understand and do successfully operations of facts and problem solving.
10. The math and language arts grades are used a school policy is being developed which lists the heading level which must be attained before promotion is possible.
11. Teacher judgement, reading level, math level, work habits/social habits.
12. N.B.C.S., Encl. of Reading Level Test, Class Performance, Behavior, Organizational skills, parents interest, write a complete sentence after looking at a picture.
13. Students progress in and potential for mastery of subject matter
14. Grades earned - 2 F's are reason for retention, age, and maturity in rare cases
15. Grade book, report cards, class participation, behavior
16. Everyday performance in the classroom, teacher test results, attendance and homework and ability to keep up with work after excessive absenteeism.
17. Academic grades, attendance, age of students
18. Test scores, grades, teacher observation of school work and behavior
19. Kindergarten retention is not allowed at our school
20. Children's achievement, performance and attendance pattern. Child's ability also is taken into consideration

Question #13: What do you currently use to decide promotion and retention? (Cont'd)

21. I use a level of books and skills. I use daily work (if child is trying)

22. Grade 3 and above - pupils with 2 E's or more in major area. Reading/math would not pass

23. List strategies used as intervention codes

24. A retention scale, recommended by the administrator is used as a counseling tool

25. Mastery of essential learning skills in relation to effort, ability, age, etc.

26. Class participation and class work. Weekly quizes and bi-weekly test

27. Mastery of skills in reading, English and spelling

28. Mastery of Essential Learning Skills in relation to ability, age, etc., retention scale as provided by office

29. We prepare 2 separate forms which address student progress. (2 E's in major subjects constitutes consideration). All forms sent to administrators who has final decision.

30. Students who have an E in 2 major subjects are retained. (In P.U., an E in reading is cause for retention)

31. Class performances - homework, test scores, kindergarten entrance and exists skills mastered.

32. Reading skills mastery, mathematic skills mastery

33. Grades received on classroom projects and activities

34. Report card grades, skills mastered at grade level

35. Skills mastered, report card grades

36. Reading skills, math skills, English skills, spelling, entrance skills, exit skills

37. Teacher observation and anecdotal records, CAT test results, amount of active progress as demonstrated by oral and written examples

38. Mastery of letter recognition, mastery of or good grasp of beginning sounds, ability to follow detailed directions, teacher observation, CAT Test Results.

Question #13: What do you currently use to decide promotion and retention? (Cont'd)

39. The use of textbook program test well a teacher made test

40. The objectives formed in conjunction with the other primary one teachers

41. Students are evaluated in all areas with the assistance of both teacher made and commercial testing tools. They are also measured by teacher observation of individual performance in retention to their peers.

42. Academic skills (grades and oral participation of reading, math, spelling, social studies, science

43. Grades in reading, math, science, social studies

44. Weekly - teacher made tests and commercial testing tools. Teacher observation of individual and progress made in major areas.

45. Failing grades in math, reading, and science

46. Failing grades in three major subjects - math, reading, science

47. Failing grades in math, reading,and science

48. Policy is "supposed to be" to retain if child has 2 E's in major subjects; ie math, science, reading or English. Much depends on teacher judgment when looking at overall situation of child.

49. Students that obtain two E's in two academic subjects are retained after the teacher judges the worth of the retention each card marking

Question #14: Please list the actions that you take before you retain a student.

1. Extra homework

2. One on one help with an aid and my prep time with a pupil

3. Parent/Teacher Conferences and extra communication

4. Exit Skills Test give for Math and Reading developed several years ago. Required 80% mastery

5. Notes sent with unsatisfactory report cards

6. Parent-Teacher Conferences at report card time and whenever they are needed

Question #14: Please list the actions that you take before you retain a student. (Cont'd)

7. Weekly contact with parents by note or phone in hope of improvement
8. Additional practice worksheets sent home
9. At times, a conference with principal, parent and teacher are helpful
10. Many times, parents will send back notes but not pay attention to what is on them - at final retention time they refuse to accept the fact of upcoming retention and insist their child be promoted
11. Additional help is given to a student at lunch and gym times
12. Change/revise method of instruction pertaining to students
13. Increase individual teacher help
14. See if student is eligible for Title I, Chapter III, etc
15. Compare test scores to work being done in classroom
16. Talk to parents, get their help
17. Increase homework or give extra work books
18. The check list would also be helpful for bilingual students and those receiving Chapter 1 or Article 3 students
19. Contact home, keep them after school (extra support services), tape stories, extra home work, student tutor, wrote up for testing if needed
20. Parent Conference, extra tutoring in weak areas, extra work sent home for tutoring
21. Inform students, inform parents, check test scores, records, class work, oral and written, check with principal
22. Assignments clearly state, assignments completed, conference with parents
23. Try to give extra help, explain to students what is expected, notes home
24. Made sure all assignments are clear
25. Allow time to make-up missed/failed assignments
26. Contact parents in writing of pending failure

Question #14: Please list the actions that you take before you retain a student. (Cont'd)

27. Discuss progress and expectations with student, parents and administrator, provide opportunities for eliminating deficits

28. Conferences with parents, notes at specified times (report cards)

29. Final retention note before report card, mid-term one month prior

30. Additional comments; Children should not be passed to grade three because they are P3 and cannot be retained in Grade 2. Two of my retentions are the result of this. these children have been behind all year. Parents should not be able to insist child should be retained. Children should be retained in kdg., when necessary. A developmental or reading readiness class should be reinstated, as many of our students do not have the experiences and backgrounds of the more affluent districts. These classrooms would be beneficial in having fewer number of retentions and dropouts (in my opinion)

31. Counsel student, talk to parents, weekly progress reports, retention letter, no improvement - failure

32. Call in parents and child letting them know the deficit areas

33. Send home possible failure notices (by mail) 3 times

34. Call parents on phone letting them know continued progress of child

35. Look at basic skills testing and last two semester grades on report card to see if any progress has been made

36. Consider past retentions, maturity and age before making final decision

37. Send home note to parent, have conference with parents, first use every means needed to help student show improvements

38. Counsel with student, counsel with parent, extra work sent home

39. Notify parents child needs assistance, provide reinforcement activities, seek remedial services, give as much extra help as time permits

40. Contact parents (first report card), counselor or social worker, cross age tutoring

41. Inform parents of unsatisfactory work throughout the year

42. Provide pupils with extra classroom assistance - tutoring, individualization, etc

43. Special homework assignments arranged

Question #14: Please list the actions that you take before you retain a student. (Cont'd)

44. Suggested activities outside of school setting example: Marygrove College

45. Individualized instruction, peer tutoring, conferences with parents, determine proper placement - evaluate

46. Contact the parents for a conference, discuss the situation with the parents and students

47. Parent-teacher conferences (at least 3), send failure notices (at least 3), discuss with other teachers progress, conferences with principal, parent, student and teacher

48. Parental contacts, Article 3 (Lab), Request tutoring, additional task for school/home, Individualize Reading, Peer tutoring

49. Numerous parent conferences, individualized instruction, peer tutoring, remedial assistance from Chapter 3 specialist

50. Notify parent immediately when I'm, aware of problem/notify them often

51. Give individual tutoring by me and by peers

52. Suggest outside tutoring to parent

53. Suggest than an evaluation of sight/hearing/ability be done

54. Parent conference, student - teacher - parent conference, failure notice by mail - conference, administrative - teacher conference concerning the child's progress

55. Reteach areas not mastered, testing, parent counseling if possible

56. See supportive services (if they seem to be needed), have conferences with the parents, try to do isolated individual help

57. Parent conferences, remedial assistance from labs, individual tutoring

58. Have a conference with parent, review grades, review mastery or non-mastery of entrance and exit skills; review all grades, hold a final conference with parent

59. Review yearly progress - academic, social, physical emotional, parent consultations, retest of questionable areas, review and retest again within last four weeks of school

60. Reviewing Mastery of skills taught, being aware of learning problems (social emotional physical), parental consultation

61. Parent involvement, weekly progress reports, one to one instructional lessons

Question #14: Please list the actions that you take before you retain a student. (Cont'd)

62. Tutoring (teacher-peer and cross-age), parental assistance, weekly update on student progress, remediation (general) in the area of weakness

63. Warning notes, parent-teacher conference, individual instruction for that child

64. Contact parents periodically about poor grades by telephone, letters, etc., conferences, failure notices

65. Individualized tutoring - teacher, peer, cross-age, parental assistance in remediation, progress reports sent weekly, child and parent conferences

66. Contact parents, send warning notes, final failure notes

67. Contact parents, send warning and failure notes, have conferences

68. Conferences w/parents, warning notes, failure notice, assigned time conf. before final report card

69. Contact parents, warning notes, failure notes, assign conferences before final report card

70. Send out warning, contact parents, send out failure notices

71. Warning notes are sent home, Parent/Teacher Conference, Failure Warning Letter at the end of the 5th card marking, Failure letter sent through the mail four weeks prior to the closing of school

Appendix C

A Sample of Forms Used in Study

GRADE 5

Office Use Only					
G:	M	F			
Ch1		Ar3	B1		
DT	_____				
SUS	_____				
E:	1	2	3	4	5

ESSENTIAL LEARNING SKILLS CHECK LIST
GRADE _____

Student Label

Name: _____

Birthdate: ___/___/___
MO DA YR

ID Number: /_/_/_/_/_/_/_/_/_/

☐ Student is no longer enrolled.

1. For what percent of the 1987-88 school year has this student been enrolled in ---

this school?	your class?
____ 0 - 25%	____ 0 - 25%
____ 26 - 50%	____ 26 - 50%
____ 51 - 75%	____ 51 - 75%
____ 76 -100%	____ 76 -100%

2. Is this student currently awaiting placement in Special Education?

____ Yes ____ No

3. Has this student been previously retained?

____ Yes ____ No

If so, list the grade(s) repeated: _____

4. Is this student currently being considered for retention?

____ Yes ____ No

5. This student has been absent and tardy approximately how many half days?

Absent ____ 5 or fewer ____ 6-10 ____ 11-20 ____ 20 or more

Tardy ____ 5 or fewer ____ 6-10 ____ 11-20 ____ 20 or more

6. Check the word that best describes this student's citizenship.

____ poor ____ satisfactory ____ excellent

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Student Profile Check List

Directions: For each skill listed, please check the most appropriate column.

Essential Learning Skills	Mastery	Non-Mastery			
		Not Yet Taught	Taught But Not Mastered	Needs Pre-requisite Skills	Late Enroll-ment
GRADE 5/LANGUAGE ARTS					
(Listening) - listen to an incomplete passage and select from four summary statements the best ending for the passage. (Generalizing)					
(Speaking) - formulate who, what, when, how, why, and where questions regarding information presented using Standard English.					
(Reading) - select from four statements the one which best describes the most probable cause and/or effect that can be inferred from the events in a selection (Inferred Cause and Effect Relationships)					
- select from four statements the one that can be verified in the selection. (Details)					
- select from four sets of four statements the one which identifies the correct sequence of events for a selection. (Sequence)					
- identify four selection-related statements as either fact or opinion. (Levels of Reality)					
(Literature) - read a passage and identify statements as being either dialogue or narrative.					
(Writing) - read an outline and use the ideas in the outline to write a two-paragraph report about the topic.					
(Spelling) - correctly spell words (selected from the fifth grade approved spelling test) in context.					
(Handwriting) - correctly form upper and lower case cursive letter legibly for all written language.					

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Student Profile Check List

Directions: For each skill listed, please check the most appropriate column.

Essential Learning Skills	Mastery	Non-Mastery			
		Not Yet Taught	Taught But Not Mastered	Needs Pre-requsite Skills	Late Enroll-ment
GRADE 5/AFFECTIVE					
(Self-Esteem) Use self direction in academic and social experiences.					
(Interpersonal Relationships) Identify social support systems.					
(Peelings) Examine emotions caused by external sources and demonstrate responses that will avoid self-destructive behavior, i.e., restraint and control.					
(Decision Making) Recognize when a decision is needed and the advantages and disadvantages of alternatives; evaluate the alternatives, make a choice based upon the evaluation, and act upon the choices.					
(Values) Name three things that are valued and state the reasons for valuing.					

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Student Profile Check List

Directions: For each skill listed, please check the most appropriate column.

Essential Learning Skills	Mastery	Non-Mastery			
		Not Yet Taught	Taught But Not Mastered	Needs Pre-requsite Skills	Late Enroll-ment
GRADE 5/MATHEMATICS					
(Calculators) Determine reasonableness of display answers.					
(Estimation) Use estimation to check the reasonableness of an answer.					
(Functions/Relations) Interpret a word problem, translate the information into an appropriate number sentence and solve, using whole numbers and money.					
(Geometry) Identify and relate two-dimensional figures to three-dimensional figures and their properties, using models and pictures (i.e., square to cube).					
(Measurement) Relate and compare metric units of measure; relate and compare customary units of measure.					
(Numeration) Interpret, illustrate, read and/or write rational numbers with or without aids. (decimals through hundredths; selected fractions with denominators no greater than 12.)					

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study
Student Profile Check List

Directions: For each skill listed, please check the most appropriate column.

Essential Learning Skills	Mastery	Non-Mastery			
		Not Yet Taught	Taught But Not Mastered	Needs Pre-requsite Skills	Late Enroll-ment
GRADE 5/MATHEMATICS					
(Operations) Divide whole numbers by one or two-digit divisors, with or without aids and/or mental arithmetic strategies.					
Find, compare and order equivalent fractions, with or without aids.					
(Patterns) Create a pattern of geometric shapes and/or numbers (including rational numbers)					
(Probability/Statistics) Use data to construct and/or select a table or graph that fits given information (pictograph, bar, and line graphs).					
(Sets and Logic) Classify numbers according to given attributes odd, even, multiples, divisors (factors).					

Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study

Teacher Questionnaire

Detroit Public Schools is considering the use of standards for determining the promotion and retention of students. As part of this process, Essential Learning Skills have been designated in Language Arts, Mathematics and Affective Education. As a participant in the Essential Learning Skills Pilot Study, you have been asked to complete a check list for each selected student.

This questionnaire presents you with an opportunity to express your opinions about both the process of this student assessment and the appropriateness of the proposed Essential Learning Skills.

Your perceptions are of utmost importance in this process; please be candid.

1. What grade level(s) do you teach?

   ____ K ____ 1 ____ 2 ____ 3 ____ 4 ____ 5

2. Do you teach --- (Check one.)

   ____ self-contained?
   ____ platoon?
   ____ other? (describe) _____

3. For what subject(s) do you give grades to students?

   ____ Mathematics ____ Language Arts

4. How much time, in minutes, was needed for you to complete the check list for one student? _____ minutes

5. Which area(s) of the check list did you complete for each child? (Check all that apply.)

   ____ Language Arts
   ____ Mathematics
   ____ Affective

6. Check the one statement below which best describes the language arts and mathematics curriculum taught in your school.

   ____ What is taught is less than the Essential Learning Skills

   ____ What is taught is nearly identical to the Essential Learning Skills

   ____ What is taught is broader than the Essential Learning Skills

Comments: _____

_____

_____

7. Check the one statement which best describes the language arts and mathematics curriculum taught in your school.

____ What is taught is less than the Strands and Objectives

____ What is taught is nearly identical to the Strands and Objectives

____ What is taught is broader than the Strands and Objectives

Comments: _____

_____

_____

8. Does your school have its own promotion/retention criteria?

____ Yes(in place) ____ In Process ____ No ____ Don't Know

9. Does your school currently have a procedure for keeping track of skills in the affective area?

____ Yes ____ No

10. To what degree do you feel the affective objectives on the Essential Learning Skills check list are related to the citizenship marks given your students? (Check one.)

____ Not at all ____ Somewhat ____ Completely

11. To what degree would the Essential Learning Skills Check List help you ---

a. make promotion decisions?

____ Not at all ____ Somewhat ____ Quite a bit

b. counsel parents and students?

____ Not at all ____ Somewhat ____ Quite a bit

c. support promotion decisions?

____ Not at all ____ Somewhat ____ Quite a bit

Comments: _____

_____

_____

12. For which students do you feel the completion of check lists would be appropriate? (Check one.)

____ All students	____ Students considered for retention
____ Students receiving Chapter 1 or Article 3 services	____ Others (list) _____
____ Bilingual students	_____
____ Special education students	_____

13. What do you currently use to decide promotion and retention? Please state.

_____

_____

_____

_____

14. Please list the actions that you take before you retain a student.

1. _____

2. _____

3. _____

4. _____